

# Prophetic Inheritance In Hadith: *Analysis of Texts and Chains.*

TwelverSHIA.NET

Peace be upon you all dear readers, this is PART I out of a three part series of research on the topic of prophetic-inheritance.

Let us explain the purpose of the first part of this research and clarify our purpose:

The Prophet (saw) said in the popular narration: “We leave behind no inheritance, what remains is charity.” And in the book of Allah (swt) we read of Sulayman inheriting Dawud in Surat al-Naml and we read of Yahya inheriting Zakariya in Surat Mariyam; the scholars of Islam stated several opinions regarding these verses; some said “It was an inheritance of prophet-hood and religious authority.” Some said: “It was that of kingdom and political authority.” Others said: “Knowledge and wisdom.”

Opponents will say these opinions are not legitimate and inheritance can only refer to money. Is inheritance in Arabic only restricted to money as they say? Are all of these popular opinions adopted by the majority of scholars corrupt?

The answer is: No, it isn't only for money; the Qur'an itself refers to many matters as “inheritance”, we present the proofs from Allah's noble book:

{Who will inherit al-Firdaus. They will abide therein eternally.} [23:11]

How can they inherit heaven? Did it belong to their fathers? Do the rules of inheritance apply to this case, such as a man gets twice as much as women? The answer is No of course. Another example:

{Then we caused to inherit the Book those We have chosen of Our servants; and among them is he who wrongs himself, and among them is he who is moderate, and among them is he who is foremost in good deeds by permission of Allah. That [inheritance] is what is the great bounty.} [35:32]

{And We had certainly given Moses guidance, and We caused the Children of Israel to inherit the Scripture} [40:53]

{And they did not become divided until after knowledge had come to them - out of jealous animosity between themselves. And if not for a word that preceded from your Lord [postponing the penalty] until a specified time, it would have been concluded between them. And indeed, those who were granted inheritance of the Scripture after them are, concerning it, in disquieting doubt.} [42:14]

This was a prime example of the inheritance of knowledge.

It is also the case in the Sunnah, as we read in the books of Ahlul-Sunnah narrations such as this one:

Rasul-Allah (saw) said in a Du'a':

بَارِكْ لِي فِي سَمْعِي وَبَصَرِي، وَاجْعَلْهُمَا الْوَارِثَ مِنِّي

[Bless my hearing and my vision and make the two of them both inherit me.]

How can his “hearing” or his “vision” inherit from him? They aren't people so how does this apply? Well inheritance is basically when an individual passes away, he leaves a matter for another individual to possess. This means that Rasul-Allah (saw) is asking Allah to guard his sense of hearing and his sight, so that he passes away while they are both healthy and blessed. As if they remain to inherit him.

In Tafseer al-Baghawi, a Sunni book, the author says when talking about Yusuf's beauty:

ويقال: إنه ورث ذلك الجمال من جدته سارة، وكانت قد أعطيت سدس الحسن

[It is said: that he inherited this beauty from his grandmother Sarah, and she was given a sixth of the world's beauty.]

The opponents sometimes like to quote weak narrations from our books, such as the one from al-Riyadh al-Nadira and Arjah al-Matalib, the prophet (saw) tells `Ali:

أنت أخي ووارثي ووصيي. قال: علي ما أرت منك؟ قال: ما يرث النبيون بعضهم بعضاً. قال: الله ورسوله أعلم. فقال: كتاب الله وسنة نبيه

[He (saw) said: "You are my brother, my heir and my depute." `Ali said: "What do I inherit from you?" He said: "What all prophets inherit from one another." `Ali said: "Allah knows best." He said: "The book of Allah and the Sunnah of his prophet."]

Although we all know that legally, `Ali is not to inherit anything from the messenger (saw), his inheritance goes to his daughters and wives and uncle al-`Abbas according to Shari`ah, yet we read in many weak narrations that the Shia quote that `Ali is his "heir".

Also in the books of the Twelver Imamiyyah, such as al-Kafi we read their authentic Hadith according to Majlisi:

إِنَّ دَاوُدَ وَرِثَ عِلْمَ الْأَنْبِيَاءِ وَ إِنَّ سُلَيْمَانَ وَرِثَ دَاوُدَ وَ إِنَّ مُحَمَّدًا ( صلى الله عليه وآله ) وَرِثَ سُلَيْمَانَ وَ إِنَّا وَرِثْنَا مُحَمَّدًا

[Dawud inherited the knowledge of the prophets, and Sulayman inherited Dawud, and Muhammad (saw) inherited Sulayman, and we inherited Muhammad.]

This narration is explicit in that what Sulayman inherited was the knowledge of Dawud, and Muhammad (saw) inherited this same knowledge.

Also another authentic Shia Hadith they have says:

إِنَّ الْعُلَمَاءَ وَرَثَةُ الْأَنْبِيَاءِ إِنَّ الْأَنْبِيَاءَ لَمْ يُورَثُوا دِينَارًا وَ لَا دِرْهَمًا وَ لَكِنْ وَرَثُوا الْعِلْمَ

[The scholars are the inheritors of the prophets, and prophets do not leave a Dinar or Dirham as inheritance, but they left knowledge.]

In a similar narration from al-Kafi:

إِنَّ الْعُلَمَاءَ وَرَثَةُ الْأَنْبِيَاءِ وَ ذَلِكَ أَنَّ الْأَنْبِيَاءَ لَمْ يُورَثُوا دِرْهَمًا وَ لَا دِينَارًا وَ إِنَّمَا أُوْرَثُوا أَحَادِيثَ مِنْ أَحَادِيثِهِمْ

[The scholars are the heirs of the prophets, and this is because prophets do not leave a Dirham or Dinar as inheritance, only their narrations.]

And in al-Kafi as well:

إِنَّ عَلِيَّ بْنَ أَبِي طَالِبٍ كَانَ هِبَةً اللَّهِ لِمُحَمَّدٍ وَ وَرِثَ عِلْمَ الْأَوْصِيَاءِ وَ عِلْمَ مَنْ كَانَ قَبْلَهُ أَمَا إِنَّ مُحَمَّدًا وَرِثَ عِلْمَ مَنْ كَانَ قَبْلَهُ مِنَ الْأَنْبِيَاءِ وَ الْمُرْسَلِينَ

[`Ali bin abi Talib was the gift from Allah to Muhammad (saw), and he inherited the knowledge of the deputies(Awsiya') and the knowledge of those before him, as for Muhammad (saw) he inherited the knowledge of those before him from prophets and messengers.]

In al-Kafi also in an authentic narration:

إِنَّ عَلِيًّا ( عليه السلام ) كَانَ عَالِمًا وَ الْعِلْمُ يُتَوَارَثُ وَ لَنْ يَهْلِكَ عَالِمٌ إِلَّا بَقِيَ مَنْ بَعْدَهُ مَنْ يَعْلَمُ عِلْمَهُ

[‘Ali was a scholar and knowledge is inherited, no scholar shall die unless he leaves one behind him who knows what he does.]

In another authentic narration from the same book:

إِنَّ الْعِلْمَ الَّذِي نَزَلَ مَعَ آدَمَ ( عليه السلام ) لَمْ يُرَفَعْ وَ الْعِلْمُ يُتَوَارَثُ وَ كَانَ عَلِيٌّ ( عليه السلام ) عَالِمَ هَذِهِ الْأُمَّةِ وَ إِنَّهُ لَمْ يَهْلِكْ مِنَّا عَالِمٌ قَطُّ إِلَّا خَلَفَهُ مِنْ أَهْلِهِ مَنْ عِلْمٌ مِثْلَ عِلْمِهِ

[The knowledge that came with Adam (as) is never gone, knowledge is inherited and ‘Ali is the scholar of this nation, no scholar from among us dies unless he’s succeeded by a person with just as much knowledge from his family.]

In another authentic narration they say:

نَحْنُ وَرَثَتُهُ أُولَى الْعَرْشِ مِنَ الرُّسُلِ أَنْ أَقِيمُوا الدِّينَ يَا آلَ مُحَمَّدٍ

[We are the heirs of Ulil-‘Azm from the messengers, in that we the family of Muhammad must uphold the religion.]

They inherited the religious leadership to uphold the laws of Allah from the messengers of strong will and determination.

In another of their narrations:

جُعِلْتُ فِدَاكَ أَخْبِرْنِي عَنِ النَّبِيِّ ( صلى الله عليه وآله ) وَرِثَ النَّبِيُّينَ كُلَّهُمْ قَالَ نَعَمْ قُلْتُ مَنْ لَدُنْ آدَمَ حَتَّى انْتَهَى إِلَى نَفْسِهِ قَالَ مَا بَعَثَ اللَّهُ نَبِيًّا إِلَّا وَ مُحَمَّدٌ ( صلى الله عليه وآله ) أَعْلَمُ مِنْهُ

[Tell me may I be sacrificed for you about the prophet (saw), did he inherit all the prophets? He said: “Yes” I said: From Adam until himself? He replied: “Allah did not send a prophet unless Muhammad (saw) is more knowledgeable.”]

Notice how when the Shia Imam heard the word “inherit” he knew full well that in the context of prophet-hood inheritance is that of knowledge.

In another of their narrations:

لَمْ يُعْطَيَا عِلْمٌ مَا يَكُونُ وَ مَا هُوَ كَائِنٌ حَتَّى تَقُومَ السَّاعَةُ وَ قَدْ وَرِثْنَاهُ مِنْ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ ( صلى الله عليه وآله ) وَرَآئَهُ

[They (both) were not given the knowledge of what was and what is to be until the hour, but we inherited it from the messenger (saw) as inheritance.]

And:

إِنَّا أَهْلُ بَيْتِ وَرَثَتْنَا الْعَفْوُ مِنْ آلِ يَعْقُوبَ وَ وَرِثَتْنَا الشُّكْرَ مِنْ آلِ دَاوُدَ

[We the household have inherited forgiveness from the family of Ya‘qoub and inherited thankfulness from the family of Dawud.]

And:

أَيُّ أَهْلِ بَيْتِي يَا جِبْرِيلُ قَالَ نَحِيبُ اللَّهِ مِنْهُمْ وَ دُرِّيَّتُهُ لِيَرِثَكَ عِلْمَ النُّبُوَّةِ كَمَا وَرَثَهُ إِبْرَاهِيمُ

[He (saw) said: Which of my Household O Jibreel? He said: The one chosen by Allah and his progeny, so he may inherit the knowledge of prophet-hood as Ibrahim inherited it.]

Also this authentic narration according to al-Majlisi in al-Kafi:

ثُمَّ مَاتَ زَكَرِيَّا فَوَرِثَهُ ابْنُهُ يَحْيَى الْكِتَابَ وَ الْحِكْمَةَ وَ هُوَ صَبِيٌّ صَغِيرٌ

[Then Zakariya died so his son Yahya inherited from him his book and his wisdom, and he was a small boy.]

This is explicit in that Yahya did not inherit more than knowledge. This is clear from the context of verses, when Allah says: {[Allah] said, "O Yahya, take the Scripture with determination." And We gave him judgement [while yet] a boy} [19:12]

In an authentic Shia narration:

فَقُلْتُ لَهُ أَنْتُمْ وَرَثَةُ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ (صلى الله عليه وآله) قَالَ نَعَمْ قُلْتُ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ (صلى الله عليه وآله) وَارِثُ الْأَنْبِيَاءِ عَلِمَ كُلُّ مَا عَلِمُوا قَالَ لِي نَعَمْ

[I said to him: You are the heirs of the messenger (saw)? He said: Yes, I said: The messenger (saw) is the heir of the prophets; he knows all that they know? He said: Yes.]

In another narration from al-Kafi:

قَتَلَ يَزِيدُ حُسَيْنًا سَلَبَهُ اللَّهُ مُلْكَهُ فَوَرَّثَهُ آلَ مَرْوَانَ فَلَمَّا قَتَلَ هِشَامَ زَيْدًا سَلَبَهُ اللَّهُ مُلْكَهُ فَوَرَّثَهُ مَرْوَانَ بْنَ مُحَمَّدٍ

[Yazid killed Husayn so Allah took his kingdom away and made the family of Marwan inherit it, then when Hisham killed Zayd bin `Ali, Allah took his kingdom and made Marwan bin Muhammad to inherit it.]

Notice that the family of Marwan is not supposed to inherit Yazid, Yazid had closer relatives who were entitled to inherit him, but this is talking of inheriting political authority.

As you can see the use of this word linguistically is not tied to money or material possession. According to these examples and many others found all over the Arabic books, we say that those opinions listed above are all legitimate and logical; this will be further clarified in PART II of our research InshaAllah.

What grabbed our interest while going through the books is that some scholars said this was an inheritance of "Money" even though there are narrations which oppose this interpretation. What made them say this and what is the truth behind this opinion?

The answer to the above question will mainly be answered in this piece by the will and permission of Allah (swt), and further clarifications will be provided in PART II Insha'Allah.

The first question in anyone's mind would be: Why did a number of Mufasssireen say "Money"? Did they not know of the Hadith written above? Or maybe they thought it was weak?

The answer is: They must have known of it and it is not acceptable from scholars of their caliber to not know of such a popular narration. As for its authenticity, it is narrated in both Bukhari and Muslim through more than one solid chain.

Well how do we explain their Qur'anic interpretation then?

Here's the good part, these scholars of Tafseer or "Mufasssireen" as they are known, they looked at the apparent Qur'anic wording and saw that so and so had inherited so and so, the first thing that pops into anyone's mind is the regular inheritance of money. They then looked at the Sunnah and saw "We leave no inheritance", so they simply concluded that the Prophet (saw) was talking only about himself!

You heard right, they thought this Hadith was tied only to the inheritance of the last of prophets and their seal Muhammad ibn `Abdillah (saw). They said he was talking about himself in the plural of respect which is used by leaders and kings, just as Sulayman said in the Qur'an:

{O people, we have been taught the language of birds, and we have been given from all things.}[27:16]

Or in the Bukhari and Muslim, the Saheehayn, we read that when a man wanted to gift a mule to Rasul-Allah (saw), he returned the gift and told him:

إِنَّهُ لَمْ يَمْنَعْنَا أَنْ نَقْبَلَ مِنْكَ إِلَّا أَنَّا كُنَّا حُرْمًا

[Nothing stopped us from accepting your gift except that we were in a state of Ihram.]

Or when the delegation of Hawazin came to him (saw) he told them:

إِنَّا لَا نَدْرِي مَنْ أَذِنَ مِنْكُمْ فِي ذَلِكَ مِمَّنْ لَمْ يَأْذَنْ، فَارْجِعُوا حَتَّى يَرْفَعَ إِلَيْنَا عُرْفَاؤُكُمْ أَمْرَكُمْ

[We do not know who amongst you has agreed to this and who has not. You should return and let your leaders inform us of your agreement.]

Or when he (saw) got a ring made for himself and said:

إِنَّا اتَّخَذْنَا خَاتَمًا، وَنَقَشْنَا فِيهِ نَفْسًا، فَلَا يَنْقُشُ عَلَيْهِ أَحَدٌ

[We have got a ring made (for ourselves) and we have engraved a certain engraving on it so none of you should get such an engraving on his ring.]

Let alone the fact that most scholars refer to themselves in plural in their own books, they would say "As we wrote" or "It has reached us that" or "We were told" etc...

A group of scholars opposed the above and gave different interpretations to every example we provided, they said that only Allah can refer to himself in plural, as is found in Tafseer al-Zamakhshari. This however, is not backed by any verse or narration, and the discussion becomes linguistical so we won't dive into it, it is only sufficient that we provided the evidence used by this team of Mufasssireen to prove their case.

At this point another important question arises, doesn't a version of the popular narration specifically say:

إِنَّا مَعْشَرُ الْأَنْبِيَاءِ لَا نُوْرَثُ

"We the prophets leave no inheritance."

Isn't it authentic? If so how do they explain it?

The question of its authenticity will be discussed below in some detail, as for how they explain it, well they have two opinions:

First opinion: The Prophet (saw) means that this is referring to the vast majority of prophets even if one or two did inherit, more on this will be shown in PART II of this research.

Second opinion: This is a "Munkar" or rejected addition, we reject it, it is a mistake and it is not acceptable as opposed to the popular narrations of "We leave no inheritance."

We read in al-Nasikh wal-Mansoukh lil-Nahhas (d.338):

وَفِي قَوْلِهِ: " لَا نُورِثُ " قَوْلَانِ أَحَدُهُمَا أَنَّهُ يُخْبِرُ عَنْهُ وَحْدَهُ كَمَا يَقُولُ الرَّئِيسُ: فَعَلْنَا وَصَنَعْنَا، وَالْقَوْلُ الْآخَرُ أَنَّ يَكُونُ لَا نُورِثُ لِجَمِيعِ الْأَنْبِيَاءِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِمْ، وَأَكْثَرُ أَهْلِ الْعِلْمِ عَلَى هَذَا الْقَوْلِ

[Regarding his saying: "We leave no inheritance" are two opinions: One is that he is talking about himself like a leader says: "We did this or we did that." The second opinion is that it encompasses all prophets (saw) and the majority of the people of knowledge are of this opinion.]

We read in Tafseer al-Qurtubi (d.671):

واختلف العلماء في تأويل قوله عليه السلام: " لا نورث ما تركنا صدقة " على قولين: أحدهما: وهو الأكثر وعليه الجمهور - أن النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم لا يورث وما ترك صدقة. والآخر: أن نبينا عليه الصلاة والسلام لم يُورث؛ لأن الله تعالى خصه بأن جعل ماله كله صدقة زيادة في فضيلته

[The scholars differed on the meaning of “We do not leave inheritance, what is left is charity.” There were two opinions: The most popular one is that a prophet is not inherited and what he leaves is charity. The second is that only our Prophet (saw) does not leave behind inheritance as Allah blessed him with this merit to increase his virtue.]

In Tafseer al-Razi (d.606) we read:

أما قوله عليه السلام: " إنا معشر الأنبياء " فهذا وإن جاز حمله على الواحد كما في قوله تعالى: إنا نحن نزلنا الذكر

لكنه مجاز وحقيقته الجمع والعدول عن الحقيقة من غير موجب لا يجوز لا سيما وقد روي قوله: " إنا معشر الأنبياء لا نورث " والأولى أن يحمل ذلك

[As for their saying that “We leave no inheritance” that it can just be restricted to him (saw), the same way Allah said: {It is We who have sent down the remembrance.} Still this is metaphorical and we must not abandon what is apparent especially since it was also narrated (in this form) “We the prophets leave no inheritance.”]

We can read this in Tafseer Adwa’ al-Bayan li Muhammad al-Ameen al-Shinqiti (d.1393):

وأما ما اشتهر في كتب أهل الأصول وغيرهم بلفظ "نحن معشر الأنبياء لا نورث" فقد أنكره جماعة من الأئمة

[As for what became popular under the following form of text “We the prophets do not leave inheritance” this was rejected by a group of Imams.]

Based on all of the above, we decided that this first part of our research is a quick look on the various chains of the above narration to discover if this opinion they adopted is justified or not? Can they be excused for having such an opinion or have they clearly strayed and avoided the truth in this matter?

To achieve fruitful and meaningful results, what we did is that we searched for the main narrations about inheritance of prophets, to see if their expressions agree with the above interpretation and to see if the expression “We the prophets” is indeed an odd addition or the actual words of the Prophet (saw). Our method was that we tried gathering those narrations with their various chains from the early books of Hadith then we categorized them based on who the main narrator is, after this we translated only the relevant part of the narration and presented their chains and studied them for defects and mistakes.

In PART I of the research, we will not be doing a thorough search for all chains in every single book, but we will check the famous books and popular narrations and this should give us a very accurate idea about the texts and chains in general. Our method fulfills the purpose of this research and there is no real need to search unpopular books as the scholars usually base their opinions on the famous narrations of the popular books not the other way around.

In the name of Allah almighty we begin,

## 1- HADITH OF `A'ISHAH ABOUT THE STORY OF FATIMAH GOING TO ABU BAKR AND WHAT HE TOLD HER:

BUKHARI:

1

Ma'mar -> Zuhri -> `Urwah -> `A'ishah / TEXT: "We offer no inheritance, all we leave behind is charity."

حَدَّثَنَا عَبْدُ اللَّهِ بْنُ مُحَمَّدٍ، حَدَّثَنَا هِشَامٌ، أَخْبَرَنَا مَعْمَرٌ، عَنِ الزُّهْرِيِّ، عَنْ عُرْوَةَ، عَنْ عَائِشَةَ " أَنَّ فَاطِمَةَ، وَالْعَبَّاسَ عَلَيْهِمَا السَّلَامُ أَتَيَا أَبَا بَكْرٍ يَلْتَمِسَانِ مِيرَاثَهُمَا مِنْ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ وَهُمَا حِينَئِذٍ يَطْلُبَانِ أَرْضَيْهِمَا مِنْ فَدَكٍ، وَسَهْمَهُمَا مِنْ خَيْبَرَ، فَقَالَ لَهُمَا أَبُو بَكْرٍ: سَمِعْتُ رَسُولَ اللَّهِ يَقُولُ: " لَا نُورَثُ مَا تَرَكْنَا صَدَقَةً، إِنَّمَا يَأْكُلُ آلُ مُحَمَّدٍ مِنْ هَذَا الْمَالِ "، قَالَ أَبُو بَكْرٍ: وَاللَّهِ لَا أَدْعُ أَمْرًا رَأَيْتُ رَسُولَ اللَّهِ يَصْنَعُهُ فِيهِ إِلَّا صَنَعْتُهُ، قَالَ: فَهَجَرْتُهُ فَاطِمَةُ فَلَمْ تَكَلِّمْهُ حَتَّى مَاتَتْ

2

Yunus -> Zuhri -> `Urwah -> `A'ishah / TEXT: "We offer no inheritance, all we leave behind is charity."

" حَدَّثَنَا إِسْمَاعِيلُ بْنُ أَبَانَ، أَخْبَرَنَا ابْنُ الْمُبَارَكِ، عَنْ يُونُسَ، عَنِ الزُّهْرِيِّ، عَنْ عُرْوَةَ، عَنْ عَائِشَةَ أَنَّ النَّبِيَّ قَالَ: " لَا نُورَثُ مَا تَرَكْنَا صَدَقَةً

3

Salih -> Zuhri -> `Urwah -> `A'ishah / TEXT: "We offer no inheritance, all we leave behind is charity."

حَدَّثَنَا عَبْدُ الْعَزِيزِ بْنُ عَبْدِ اللَّهِ، حَدَّثَنَا إِبْرَاهِيمُ بْنُ سَعْدٍ، عَنْ صَالِحٍ، عَنْ ابْنِ شِهَابٍ، قَالَ: أَخْبَرَنِي عُرْوَةُ بْنُ الزُّبَيْرِ، أَنَّ عَائِشَةَ أُمَّ الْمُؤْمِنِينَ رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهَا، أَخْبَرَتْهُ أَنَّ فَاطِمَةَ عَلَيْهَا السَّلَامُ ابْنَةُ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ: " سَأَلْتُ أَبَا بَكْرٍ الصِّدِّيقَ بَعْدَ وَفَاةِ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ أَنْ يَفْصِلَ لَهَا مِيرَاثَهَا مِمَّا تَرَكَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ مِمَّا أَفَاءَ اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ، فَقَالَ: لَهَا أَبُو بَكْرٍ إِنَّ رَسُولَ اللَّهِ قَالَ: " لَا نُورَثُ مَا تَرَكْنَا صَدَقَةً فَغَضِبْتُ فَاطِمَةُ بِنْتُ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ فَهَجَرْتُ أَبَا بَكْرٍ، فَلَمْ تَزَلْ مُهَاجِرَتُهُ حَتَّى تُوَفِّيتُ وَعَاشَيْتُ بَعْدَ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ سِتَّةَ أَشْهُرٍ

4

Shu'ayb -> Zuhri -> `Urwah -> `A'ishah / TEXT: "We offer no inheritance, all we leave behind is charity."

حَدَّثَنَا أَبُو الْيَمَانِ، أَخْبَرَنَا شُعَيْبٌ، عَنِ الزُّهْرِيِّ، قَالَ: حَدَّثَنِي عُرْوَةُ بْنُ الزُّبَيْرِ، عَنْ عَائِشَةَ، أَنَّ فَاطِمَةَ عَلَيْهَا السَّلَامُ أَرْسَلَتْ إِلَى أَبِي بَكْرٍ تَسْأَلُهُ مِيرَاثَهَا مِنَ النَّبِيِّ فِيمَا أَفَاءَ اللَّهُ عَلَى رَسُولِهِ تَطْلُبُ صَدَقَةَ النَّبِيِّ الَّتِي بِالْمَدِينَةِ، وَفَدَكٍ وَمَا بَقِيَ مِنْ خُمْسِ خَيْبَرَ، فَقَالَ أَبُو بَكْرٍ: إِنَّ رَسُولَ اللَّهِ قَالَ: " لَا نُورَثُ مَا تَرَكْنَا فَهُوَ صَدَقَةٌ إِنَّمَا يَأْكُلُ آلُ مُحَمَّدٍ مِنْ هَذَا الْمَالِ يَعْنِي مَالِ اللَّهِ لَيْسَ لَهُمْ أَنْ يَزِيدُوا عَلَى الْمَأْكُلِ

5

`Uqayl -> Zuhri -> `Urwah -> `A'ishah / TEXT: "We offer no inheritance, all we leave behind is charity."

حَدَّثَنَا يَحْيَى بْنُ بُكَيْرٍ، حَدَّثَنَا اللَّيْثُ، عَنْ عَقِيلٍ، عَنْ ابْنِ شِهَابٍ، عَنْ عُرْوَةَ، عَنْ عَائِشَةَ، أَنَّ فَاطِمَةَ عَلَيْهَا السَّلَامُ بِنْتُ النَّبِيِّ أَرْسَلَتْ إِلَى أَبِي بَكْرٍ تَسْأَلُهُ مِيرَاثَهَا مِنْ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ مِمَّا أَفَاءَ اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ بِالْمَدِينَةِ، وَفَدَكٍ وَمَا بَقِيَ مِنْ خُمْسِ خَيْبَرَ، فَقَالَ أَبُو بَكْرٍ: إِنَّ رَسُولَ اللَّهِ قَالَ: " لَا نُورَثُ مَا تَرَكْنَا صَدَقَةً، إِنَّمَا يَأْكُلُ آلُ مُحَمَّدٍ فِي هَذَا الْمَالِ

ABU `AWANAH:

1

Ishaq bin Rashid -> Zuhri -> `Urwah -> `A'ishah / TEXT: "We offer no inheritance, all we leave behind is charity."

حَدَّثَنَا مُحَمَّدُ بْنُ عَوْفٍ الْحُمْصِيُّ، قَتْنَا عُثْمَانَ بْنَ سَعِيدٍ بْنِ كَثِيرٍ بْنِ دِينَارٍ، وَبِشْرُ بْنُ شُعَيْبٍ، قَالَ عُثْمَانُ ثنا شُعَيْبُ بْنُ أَبِي حَزْمَةَ، عَنِ الزُّهْرِيِّ، عَنْ عُرْوَةَ، أَنَّ عَائِشَةَ، أَخْبَرَتْهُ أَنَّ فَاطِمَةَ ابْنَةَ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ أَرْسَلَتْ إِلَى أَبِي بَكْرٍ تَسْأَلُهُ مِيرَاثَهَا مِنْ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ فِيمَا أَفَاءَ اللَّهُ عَلَى رَسُولِهِ، وَفَاطِمَةُ تَطْلُبُ صَدَقَةَ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ الَّتِي بِالْمَدِينَةِ وَفَدَكٍ وَمَا بَقِيَ مِنْ خُمْسِ خَيْبَرَ، قَالَتْ عَائِشَةُ: فَقَالَ أَبُو بَكْرٍ إِنَّ النَّبِيَّ قَالَ: " لَا نُورَثُ، مَا تَرَكْنَا صَدَقَةً، إِنَّمَا يَأْكُلُ آلُ مُحَمَّدٍ مِنْ هَذَا الْمَالِ "، يَعْنِي مَالِ اللَّهِ، لَيْسَ لَهُمْ أَنْ يَزِيدُوا عَلَى الْمَأْكُلِ، وَإِنِّي وَاللَّهِ لَا أَعِيرُ شَيْئًا مِنْ صَدَقَاتِ النَّبِيِّ عَنْ حَالِهَا الَّتِي كَانَتْ عَلَيْهَا فِي عَهْدِ النَّبِيِّ وَلَا عَمَلًا فِيهَا بِمَا عَمِلَ فِيهَا النَّبِيُّ

فَأَبَى أَبُو بَكْرٍ أَنْ يَدْفَعَ إِلَى فَاطِمَةَ مِنْهَا شَيْئًا، حَدَّثَنَا أَبُو أُمَيَّةَ، قَتْنَا أَبُو الْيَمَانِ، قَالَ: أَنبَا شُعَيْبٌ، بِإِسْنَادِهِ مِثْلَهُ، حَدَّثَنَا مُحَمَّدُ بْنُ كَثِيرٍ الْحَرَّانِيُّ، قَتْنَا مُحَمَّدُ بْنُ مُوسَى بْنِ أَعْيَنَ، قَالَ: حَدَّثَنِي أَبِي، عَنْ إِسْحَاقَ بْنِ رَاشِدٍ، عَنِ الزُّهْرِيِّ، قَالَ: حَدَّثَنِي عُرْوَةُ بْنُ الزُّبَيْرِ، أَنَّ عَائِشَةَ، أَخْبَرَتْهُ بِخَوِّهِ

#### AL-SADIS MIN AL-FAWA'ID AL-MUNTAQAT LI-ABI AL-FAWARIS:

1

`Abdul-Rahman bin `Abdullah al-`Umari -> His father -> `Abdul-Rahman bin al-Qasim -> His father -> `A'ishah.

`Abdul-Rahman bin `Abdullah al-`Umari -> His father -> Hisham -> His father -> `A'ishah.

TEXT: "We the prophets offer no inheritance, all we leave behind is charity."

حَدَّثَنَا عَبْدُ اللَّهِ، ثنا عَبْدُ اللَّهِ بْنُ عَوْنٍ، ثنا عَبْدُ الرَّحْمَنِ بْنُ عَبْدِ اللَّهِ الْعُمَرِيُّ، عَنْ أَبِيهِ، عَنْ عَبْدِ الرَّحْمَنِ بْنِ الْقَاسِمِ، عَنْ أَبِيهِ، عَنْ عَائِشَةَ. وَهَشَامٌ، عَنْ أَبِيهِ، عَنْ عَائِشَةَ، عَنْ أَبِي بَكْرٍ قَالَ: سَمِعْتُ رَسُولَ اللَّهِ يَقُولُ: " إِنَّا مَعْشَرَ الْأَنْبِيَاءِ لَا نُورَثُ، مَا تَرَكَنَا صَدَقَةٌ

Note: `Abdul-Rahman is Matrouk & his father is weak.

#### **ANALYSIS:**

This is the popular long narration of the mother of believers `A'ishah in which she tells the story of Fatimah going to Abu Bakr al-Siddeeq accompanied by al-`Abbas to ask for her inheritance and the shares.

The narration is that of Imam Shihab-ul-Deen al-Zuhri mainly, all different texts come from the different narrations of al-Zuhri's students. Let us take a look at the texts and chains of the narration of Abu Bakr and see if it contains the words "We the prophets do not leave inheritance." or just "We do not leave inheritance."

Ma`mar, Yunus, Salih, Shu`ayb, `Uqayl and Ishaq are all some of the biggest scholars and students of Imam al-Zuhri, not one of them narrated this Hadith with the expression "We the prophets." Keeping in mind that this is the most popular narration then it is surely a giant boost in favor of those scholars who are of the opinion that Rasul-Allah (saw) only intended himself.

This does not mean that the opposing team's opinion is any weaker, as the fact that he (saw) said: "We leave no inheritance." This alone is enough to support the opinion of the second team since he spoke in plural, so no one can use the above to criticize either team.

Has this narration been reported from other than al-Zuhri? And has it not been reported in any of the sources that `A'ishah narrated this Hadith with the expression "We the prophets."?

The answer to both is YES, in the last source which was Fawa'id abu al-Fawaris we do read about `A'ishah narrating it like this, the issues are: **A-** The chain is terribly weak. **B-** It contradicts the most authentic of chains from `A'ishah, which is al-Zuhri's Hadith.



## 2- HADITH OF `A'ISHAH REMINDING THE OTHER WIVES WHEN THEY WISHED TO ASK FOR THEIR SHARE:

MUSLIM:

1

Malik -> Zuhri -> `Urwah -> `A'ishah / TEXT: "We offer no inheritance, all we leave behind it becomes charity."

حَدَّثَنَا يَحْيَى بْنُ يَحْيَى، قَالَ: قَرَأْتُ عَلَى مَالِكٍ، عَنْ ابْنِ شِهَابٍ، عَنْ عُرْوَةَ، عَنْ عَائِشَةَ، أَنَّهَا قَالَتْ: إِنَّ أَزْوَاجَ النَّبِيِّ حِينَ تُوفِّي رَسُولُ اللَّهِ أَرَدْنَ أَنْ يَبْعَثَنَّ عُثْمَانَ الصَّدِيقَ فَيَسْأَلَنَّهُنَّ مِيرَاثَهُنَّ مِنَ النَّبِيِّ فَقَالَتْ عَائِشَةُ لَهُنَّ: أَلَيْسَ قَدْ قَالَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ: " لَا نُورَثُ مَا تَرَكْنَا فَهُوَ صَدَقَةٌ بَيْنَ عَقَانِ إِلَى أَبِي بَكْرٍ، فَيَسْأَلُنَّهُ مِيرَاثَهُنَّ مِنَ النَّبِيِّ قَالَتْ عَائِشَةُ لَهُنَّ: أَلَيْسَ قَدْ قَالَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ: " لَا نُورَثُ مَا تَرَكْنَا فَهُوَ صَدَقَةٌ

ABU DAWUD:

1

Usamah bin Zayd -> Zuhri -> `Urwah -> `A'ishah / TEXT: "We offer no inheritance, all we leave behind it becomes charity."

حَدَّثَنَا الْقَعْنَبِيُّ، عَنْ مَالِكٍ، عَنْ ابْنِ شِهَابٍ، عَنْ عُرْوَةَ، عَنْ عَائِشَةَ، أَنَّهَا قَالَتْ: إِنَّ أَزْوَاجَ النَّبِيِّ حِينَ تُوفِّي رَسُولُ اللَّهِ أَرَدْنَ أَنْ يَبْعَثَنَّ عُثْمَانَ بْنَ عَفَّانٍ إِلَى أَبِي بَكْرٍ الصَّدِيقِ فَيَسْأَلَنَّهُنَّ مِيرَاثَهُنَّ مِنَ النَّبِيِّ فَقَالَتْ لَهُنَّ عَائِشَةُ: أَلَيْسَ قَدْ قَالَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ: " لَا نُورَثُ مَا تَرَكْنَا فَهُوَ صَدَقَةٌ "، حَدَّثَنَا مُحَمَّدُ بْنُ يَحْيَى بْنِ فَارَسٍ، حَدَّثَنَا إِبْرَاهِيمُ بْنُ حَمْرَةَ، حَدَّثَنَا حَاتِمُ بْنُ إِسْمَاعِيلَ، عَنْ أَسَامَةَ بْنِ زَيْدٍ، عَنْ ابْنِ شِهَابٍ، بِإِسْنَادِهِ نَحْوَهُ قُلْتُ: أَلَا تَتَّقِينَ اللَّهَ أَلَمْ تَسْمَعَنَّ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ يَقُولُ: " لَا نُورَثُ مَا تَرَكْنَا فَهُوَ صَدَقَةٌ "، وَإِنَّمَا هَذَا الْمَالُ لِأَلِ مُحَمَّدٍ لِنَائِبَتِهِمْ وَلِضَيْفِهِمْ فَإِذَا مِتُّ فَهُوَ إِلَى مَنْ وَلِيَ الْأَمْرَ مِنْ بَعْدِي

MUSNAD AL-RABI':

1

Abu `Ubaydah -> Jabir -> `A'ishah / TEXT: "We the prophets offer no inheritance, all we leave behind it becomes charity."

أَبُو عُبَيْدَةَ، عَنْ جَابِرٍ، عَنْ عَائِشَةَ، رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهَا، قَالَتْ: " حِينَ تُوفِّي رَسُولُ اللَّهِ أَرَادَ نِسَاؤُهُ أَنْ يَبْعَثَنَّ عُثْمَانَ بْنَ عَفَّانٍ إِلَى أَبِي بَكْرٍ يَسْأَلَنَّهُ مِيرَاثَهُنَّ مِنْ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ فَقُلْتُ لَهُنَّ: أَلَيْسَ قَدْ قَالَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ: " نَحْنُ مَعَاشِرَ الْأَنْبِيَاءِ لَا نُورَثُ، مَا تَرَكْنَاهُ فَهُوَ صَدَقَةٌ

Note: Abu `Ubaydah is Majhool.

`ABDUL-RAZZAQ:

1

Ma`mar -> Zuhri -> `Urwah -> `A'ishah / TEXT: "We offer no inheritance, all we leave behind is charity?"

عَنْ مَعْمَرٍ، عَنِ الزُّهْرِيِّ، عَنْ عُرْوَةَ، وَعَمْرَةَ، قَالَا: " إِنَّ أَزْوَاجَ النَّبِيِّ أُرْسِلْنَ إِلَى أَبِي بَكْرٍ يَسْأَلْنَ مِيرَاثَهُنَّ مِنْ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ فَأَرْسَلْتُ إِلَيْهِنَّ عَائِشَةَ: أَلَا تَتَّقِينَ اللَّهَ؟ أَلَمْ يَقُلْ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ: " لَا نُورَثُ، مَا تَرَكْنَا صَدَقَةٌ؟ قَالَ: فَارْضَيْنَ بِقَوْلِهَا، وَتَرَكَنَّ ذَلِكَ

ABU `AWANAH:

1

`Uqayl -> Zuhri -> `Urwah -> `A'ishah / TEXT: "We offer no inheritance -meaning himself- all we leave behind is charity."

حَدَّثَنَا ابْنُ عُزَيْرٍ، قَتْنَا سَلَامَةَ بْنَ رُوْحٍ، عَنْ عُقَيْلٍ، قَالَ: قَالَ ابْنُ شِهَابٍ، فَحَدَّثَنِي ذَلِكَ يَعْنِي حَدِيثَ مَالِكِ بْنِ أَوْسٍ، عَنْ عُمَرَ، عَنْ عُرْوَةَ بْنِ الزُّبَيْرِ قَالَ: صَدَقَ مَالِكُ بْنُ أَوْسٍ، أَنَا، سَمِعْتُ عَائِشَةَ رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهَا، زَوْجَ النَّبِيِّ يَقُولُ: أُرْسِلَ أَزْوَاجُ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ عُثْمَانُ بْنُ عَفَّانٍ رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ إِلَى أَبِي بَكْرٍ رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ، يَسْأَلُنَّهُ مِيرَاثَهُنَّ مِمَّا أَقَاءَ اللَّهُ عَلَى رَسُولِهِ، حَتَّى كُنْتُ أَنَا، تَعْنِي نَفْسَهَا، أَرُدُّهِنَّ عَنْ ذَلِكَ، فَقُلْتُ لَهُنَّ: أَلَا تَتَّقِينَ اللَّهَ؟ أَلَمْ تَعْلَمَنَّ أَنَّ رَسُولَ اللَّهِ كَانَ يَقُولُ: " لَا نُورَثُ، يُرِيدُ بِذَلِكَ نَفْسَهُ، مَا تَرَكْنَا صَدَقَةٌ، إِنَّمَا يَأْكُلُ آلُ مُحَمَّدٍ فِي هَذَا الْمَالِ "، فَانْتَهَى أَزْوَاجُ النَّبِيِّ إِلَى مَا أَخْبَرْتُهُنَّ

## TABARANI:

1

Salih -> Zuhri -> `Urwah -> `A'ishah / TEXT: "We offer no inheritance, all we leave behind is charity."

حَدَّثَنَا عُثْمَانُ بْنُ خَالِدٍ بْنُ عَمْرِو السَّلَفِيُّ الْجَمْعِيُّ، قَالَ: نَا إِبْرَاهِيمُ بْنُ الْعَلَاءِ الْجَمْعِيُّ، قَالَ: نَا إِسْمَاعِيلُ بْنُ عَيَّاشٍ، عَنْ جَعْفَرِ بْنِ الْحَارِثِ، عَنْ مُحَمَّدِ بْنِ إِسْحَاقَ، عَنْ صَالِحِ بْنِ كَيْسَانَ، عَنْ الزُّهْرِيِّ، عَنْ عُرْوَةَ، عَنْ عَائِشَةَ، قَالَتْ: أُرْسِلَ أَزْوَاجُ النَّبِيِّ عُثْمَانُ بْنُ عَفَّانَ إِلَى أَبِي بَكْرٍ يَسْأَلْنَهُ مِيرَاثَهُنَّ مِنْ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ قَالَتْ عَائِشَةُ: فَكُنْتُ أَنَا الَّتِي رَدَدْنَهُنَّ عَنْ ذَلِكَ، أُرْسِلْتُ إِلَيْهِنَّ: لَا تَفْعَلْنَ، أَمَا سَمِعْتُنَّ رَسُولَ اللَّهِ يَقُولُ: " لَا نُورَثُ، مَا تَرَكْنَا صَدَقَةٌ "، فَرَجَعْنَ

2

Shu`ayb -> Zuhri -> `Urwah -> `A'ishah / TEXT: "We offer no inheritance -meaning himself- all we leave behind is charity."

حَدَّثَنَا أَبُو زُرْعَةَ، ثنا أَبُو الْيَمَانِ، أَخْبَرَنَا شُعَيْبٌ، عَنْ الزُّهْرِيِّ، عَنْ عُرْوَةَ، قَالَ: سَمِعْتُ عَائِشَةَ، تَقُولُ: أُرْسِلَ أَزْوَاجُ النَّبِيِّ عُثْمَانُ إِلَى أَبِي بَكْرٍ يَسْأَلْنَهُ ثَمَنَهُنَّ مِمَّا أَفَاءَ اللَّهُ عَلَى رَسُولِهِ، فَكَتَبَ: أَنَا أَرُدُّهُنَّ عَنْ ذَلِكَ، فَقُلْتُ لَهُنَّ: أَلَا تَتَّقِينَ اللَّهَ؟ أَلَمْ تَعْلَمْنَ أَنَّ رَسُولَ اللَّهِ كَانَ يَقُولُ: " لَا نُورَثُ يُرِيدُ بِذَلِكَ نَفْسَهُ مَا تَرَكْنَا صَدَقَةٌ، إِنَّمَا يَأْكُلُ آلُ مُحَمَّدٍ مِنْ هَذَا الْمَالِ "، فَأَنْتَهَى أَزْوَاجُ النَّبِيِّ إِلَى مَا أَخْبَرْتُهُنَّ

## ANALYSIS:

This is the narration of `A'ishah in which she reminds the other wives, as they were about to send `Uthman to request from Abu Bakr their share of the Fay' of Madinah, that they should not ask for such a thing because Rasul-Allah (saw) left no inheritance. This is a different narration that Imam al-Zuhri has narrated at a different occasion, also from `Urwah then from `A'ishah, so let us take a look at its texts and chains.

Malik, Usamah, Ma`mar, `Uqayl, Salih and Shu`ayb all of them renowned scholars of Hadith, they narrated it from Imam al-Zuhri in this form "We offer no inheritance" and none of them mentioned "We the prophets leave no inheritance." This proves so far that Imam al-Zuhri never narrated this narration with that addition, and it gives further strength to the opinion of the second team of scholars although just like the one before it, this narration in no way weakens the opinion of the first team who says that the meaning is general for all prophets.

Now if we are to look at the narrations of Shu`ayb and `Uqayl, the two students of al-Zuhri, we will find a new addition to the text not previously found, we find the words "meaning himself." This addition is actually from the strongest arguments of the first team, those that allow the inheritance of money, they say that this is proof that the prophet (saw) only spoke of himself, not of the others.

The second team who prohibits inheritance of money, they reply to them by saying:

-It is not established that these are the words of the Prophet (saw) since most narrations do not contain these words. It is possibly an additional explanation by the narrator, namely al-Zuhri who is known for Idraj in some cases as he tries to explain what he narrates or comments on it.

-This expression does not contradict the fact that all prophets leave no inheritance, as it does not exclude the other prophets from its ruling because it does not say "Meaning ONLY himself". However, it simply clarifies that he meant himself in that this law applies to him like it applied to those before him.

Finally, there is a narration from `A'ishah in this Hadith where she reports: "We the prophets offer no inheritance." It is in Musnad al-Rabi`, but rejected because abu `Ubaydah Muslim bin abi Kareemah is unknown, also Jabir bin Zayd al-Azdi is not known to have narrated from `A'ishah.

### 3- HADITH OF `A'ISHAH ABOUT `ALI GIVING BAY`AH TO ABU BAKR:

AHMAD:

1

Ma`mar -> Zuhri -> `Urwah -> `A'ishah / TEXT: "We offer no inheritance, all we leave behind is charity."

حَدَّثَنَا مُحَمَّدُ بْنُ إِبْرَاهِيمَ الْأَصْبَهَانِيُّ جَارُ أَبِي بَكْرٍ بْنُ أَبِي دَاوُدَ قَتْنَا أَبُو مَسْعُودٍ، قَالَ: نَا عَبْدُ الرَّزَّاقِ، قَالَ أَنَا مَعْمَرٌ، عَنِ الزُّهْرِيِّ، عَنْ عُرْوَةَ، عَنْ عَائِشَةَ، أَنَّ عَلِيًّا قَالَ لِأَبِي بَكْرٍ: وَاللَّهِ مَا مَنَعَنَا أَنْ نُبَايِعَكَ إِنكَارًا مِنَّا لِفَضْلِكَ، وَلَا تَنَافُسٌ مِنَّا عَلَيْكَ لِحَيْثُ سَاقَهُ اللَّهُ إِلَيْكَ، وَلَكِنَّا كُنَّا نَرَى أَنَّ لَنَا فِي هَذَا الْأَمْرِ حَقًّا، فَاسْتَبَدَدْتُمْ عَلَيْنَا، ثُمَّ ذَكَرَ قَرَابَتَهُ مَعَ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ حَتَّى بَكَى أَبُو بَكْرٍ، ثُمَّ صَمَتَ، ثُمَّ تَشَهَّدَ أَبُو بَكْرٍ، فَقَالَ: وَاللَّهِ لَقَرَابَةُ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ أَحَبُّ إِلَيَّ مِنْ قَرَابَتِي، وَإِنِّي وَاللَّهِ مَا أَلَوْتُ فِي هَذِهِ الْأَمْوَالِ الَّتِي بَيْنَنَا وَبَيْنَكُمْ عَنِ الْخَيْرِ، وَلَكِنِّي سَمِعْتُ رَسُولَ اللَّهِ يَقُولُ: " لَا نُورَثُ، مَا تَرَكْنَا صَدَقَةً، إِنَّمَا يَأْكُلُ آلُ مُحَمَّدٍ فِي هَذَا الْمَالِ

Note: This is odd as this narration is a summary of the big ones narrated from `A'ishah.

#### ANALYSIS:

This is an odd version of the long Hadith of `A'ishah, this is because `A'ishah's Hadith is divided into two parts, the first part is talking about Fatimah going to Abu Bakr then Abu Bakr replying with the prophetic narration, the second part is how `Ali later gave Bay`ah to Abu Bakr and they excused each other.

In this version we read only the second part and in it is the prophetic narration which was supposed to be in the first part. In other words, the difference is not in the expressions but their order, so no new benefits can be derived from this one.

#### 4- HADITH OF `ABBAS AND `ALI SEEKING `UMAR'S JUDGEMENT:

BUKHARI:

1

`Uqayl -> Zuhri -> Malik bin Aws -> `Umar / TEXT: "We offer no inheritance, all we leave behind is charity." The messenger of Allah means himself.

حَدَّثَنَا يَحْيَى بْنُ بُكَيْرٍ، حَدَّثَنَا اللَّيْثُ، عَنْ عُقَيْلٍ، عَنْ ابْنِ شِهَابٍ، قَالَ: أَخْبَرَنِي مَالِكُ بْنُ أَوْسِ بْنِ الْحَدَثَانِ، وَكَانَ مُحَمَّدُ بْنُ جُبَيْرٍ بْنُ مُطْعِمٍ ذَكَرَ لِي مِنْ حَدِيثِهِ ذَلِكَ، فَأَنْطَلَقْتُ حَتَّى دَخَلْتُ عَلَيْهِ فَسَأَلْتُهُ، فَقَالَ: أَنْطَلَقْتُ حَتَّى أَدْخُلَ عَلَى عُمَرَ، فَأَتَاهُ حَاجِبُهُ يَرْفَأُ، فَقَالَ: هَلْ لَكَ فِي عُثْمَانَ، وَعَبْدِ الرَّحْمَنِ، وَالزُّبَيْرِ، وَسَعْدٍ؟ قَالَ: نَعَمْ، فَأَذِنَ لَهُمْ، ثُمَّ قَالَ: هَلْ لَكَ فِي عَلِيٍّ، وَعَبَّاسٍ؟ قَالَ: نَعَمْ، قَالَ عَبَّاسٌ: يَا أَمِيرَ الْمُؤْمِنِينَ: أَفْضُ بَيْنِي وَبَيْنَ هَذَا، قَالَ: أَنْشُدْكُمْ بِاللَّهِ الَّذِي بِإِذْنِهِ تَقُومُ السَّمَاءُ وَالْأَرْضُ، هَلْ تَعْلَمُونَ أَنَّ رَسُولَ اللَّهِ قَالَ " لَا نُورَثُ مَا تَرَكْنَا صَدَقَةٌ " يُرِيدُ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ نَفْسَهُ، فَقَالَ الرَّهْطُ: قَدْ قَالَ ذَلِكَ

2

Shu`ayb -> Zuhri -> Malik bin Aws -> `Umar / TEXT: "We offer no inheritance, all we leave behind is charity." The messenger of Allah means himself.

حَدَّثَنَا أَبُو الْيَمَانِ، أَخْبَرَنَا شُعَيْبٌ، عَنْ الزُّهْرِيِّ، قَالَ: أَخْبَرَنِي مَالِكُ بْنُ أَوْسِ بْنِ الْحَدَثَانِ النَّصْرِيُّ، أَنَّ عُمَرَ بْنَ الْخَطَّابِ رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ دَعَاهُ إِذْ جَاءَهُ حَاجِبُهُ يَرْفَأُ، فَقَالَ: " هَلْ لَكَ فِي عُثْمَانَ، وَعَبْدِ الرَّحْمَنِ، وَالزُّبَيْرِ، وَسَعْدٍ يَسْتَأْذِنُونَ؟ فَقَالَ: نَعَمْ، فَأَدْخَلَهُمْ فَلَبِثَ قَلِيلًا ثُمَّ جَاءَ، فَقَالَ: هَلْ لَكَ فِي عَبَّاسٍ، وَعَلِيٍّ يَسْتَأْذِنَانِ؟ قَالَ: نَعَمْ، فَلَمَّا دَخَلَا، قَالَ عَبَّاسٌ: يَا أَمِيرَ الْمُؤْمِنِينَ أَفْضُ بَيْنِي وَبَيْنَ هَذَا، وَهُمَا يَخْتَصِمَانِ فِي الَّذِي أَفَاءَ اللَّهُ عَلَى رَسُولِهِ مِنْ بَنِي النَّضِيرِ فَاسْتَبَّ عَلِيٌّ، وَعَبَّاسٌ، فَقَالَ الرَّهْطُ: يَا أَمِيرَ الْمُؤْمِنِينَ أَفْضُ بَيْنَهُمَا وَأَرْحُ أَحَدَهُمَا مِنَ الْآخَرِ، فَقَالَ عُمَرُ: اتَّبِعُوا أَنْشُدْكُمْ بِاللَّهِ الَّذِي بِإِذْنِهِ تَقُومُ السَّمَاءُ وَالْأَرْضُ هَلْ تَعْلَمُونَ أَنَّ رَسُولَ اللَّهِ قَالَ: " لَا نُورَثُ، مَا تَرَكْنَا صَدَقَةٌ " يُرِيدُ بِذَلِكَ نَفْسَهُ، قَالُوا: قَدْ قَالَ ذَلِكَ

MUSLIM:

1

Malik -> Zuhri -> Malik bin Aws -> `Umar / TEXT: "We offer no inheritance, all we leave behind is charity."

وَحَدَّثَنِي عَبْدُ اللَّهِ بْنُ مُحَمَّدٍ بْنُ أَسْمَاءَ الصُّبَيْعِيُّ، حَدَّثَنَا جُوَيْرِيَةُ، عَنْ مَالِكٍ، عَنْ الزُّهْرِيِّ: أَنَّ مَالِكَ بْنَ أَوْسٍ حَدَّثَهُ، قَالَ: " أُرْسِلَ إِلَيَّ عُمَرُ بْنُ الْخَطَّابِ، فَجِئْتُهُ حِينَ تَعَالَى النَّهَارُ، قَالَ: فَوَجَدْتُهُ فِي بَيْتِهِ جَالِسًا عَلَى سَرِيرٍ مُفْضِيًا إِلَى رُمَالِهِ مَتَكِّنًا عَلَى وَسَادَةٍ مِنْ أَدَمٍ، فَقَالَ لِي: يَا مَالُ إِنَّهُ قَدْ دَفَعَ أَهْلُ أَبْنِيَاتٍ مِنْ قَوْمِكَ وَقَدْ أَمَرْتُ فِيهِمْ بِرَضْخِ فَخْذِهِ، فَاقْسِمُهُ بَيْنَهُمْ، قَالَ: قُلْتُ: لَوْ أَمَرْتُ بِهِذَا غَيْرِي، قَالَ: خُذْهُ يَا مَالُ، قَالَ: فَجَاءَ يَرْفَأُ، فَقَالَ: هَلْ لَكَ يَا أَمِيرَ الْمُؤْمِنِينَ فِي عُثْمَانَ، وَعَبْدِ الرَّحْمَنِ بْنِ عَوْفٍ، وَالزُّبَيْرِ، وَسَعْدٍ؟ فَقَالَ عُمَرُ: نَعَمْ فَأَذِنَ لَهُمْ، فَدَخَلُوا ثُمَّ جَاءَ، فَقَالَ: هَلْ لَكَ فِي عَبَّاسٍ، وَعَلِيٍّ؟ قَالَ: نَعَمْ، فَأَذِنَ لَهُمَا، فَقَالَ عَبَّاسٌ: يَا أَمِيرَ الْمُؤْمِنِينَ، أَفْضُ بَيْنِي وَبَيْنَ هَذَا الْكَاذِبِ الْإِثْمِ الْغَادِرِ الْخَائِنِ، فَقَالَ: الْقَوْمُ أَجَلُ يَا أَمِيرَ الْمُؤْمِنِينَ، فَأَفْضُ بَيْنَهُمْ وَأَرْحُهُمْ، فَقَالَ مَالِكُ بْنُ أَوْسٍ: يُخْبِلُ إِلَيَّ أَنَّهُمْ قَدْ كَانُوا قَدَّمُوهُمْ لِذَلِكَ، فَقَالَ عُمَرُ: اتَّبِعُوا أَنْشُدْكُمْ بِاللَّهِ الَّذِي بِإِذْنِهِ تَقُومُ السَّمَاءُ وَالْأَرْضُ أَتَعْلَمُونَ أَنَّ رَسُولَ اللَّهِ قَالَ: " لَا نُورَثُ مَا تَرَكْنَا صَدَقَةٌ، قَالُوا: نَعَمْ

NASA'I:

1

Ayyub -> `Ikrimah bin Khalid -> Malik bin Aws -> `Umar / TEXT: "We offer no inheritance, all we leave behind is charity."

أَخْبَرَنَا عَلِيُّ بْنُ حُجْرٍ، قَالَ: حَدَّثَنَا إِسْمَاعِيلُ يَعْنِي ابْنَ إِبرَاهِيمَ، عَنْ أَيُّوبَ، عَنْ عِكْرِمَةَ بْنِ خَالِدٍ، عَنْ مَالِكِ بْنِ أَوْسِ بْنِ الْحَدَثَانِ، قَالَ: جَاءَ الْعَبَّاسُ، وَعَلِيٌّ إِلَى عُمَرَ يَخْتَصِمَانِ، فَقَالَ الْعَبَّاسُ أَفْضُ بَيْنِي وَبَيْنَ هَذَا، فَقَالَ النَّاسُ: أَفْصِلْ بَيْنَهُمَا، فَقَالَ عُمَرُ: لَا أَفْصِلُ بَيْنَهُمَا، قَدْ عَلِمَا أَنَّ رَسُولَ اللَّهِ قَالَ: " لَا نُورَثُ مَا تَرَكْنَا صَدَقَةٌ

2

Muhammad bin Mansour -> Sufiyan bin `Uayyaynah -> Amro bin Dinar -> Zuhri -> Malik bin Aws -> `Umar / TEXT: "We the prophets offer no inheritance, all we leave behind is charity?"

أَخْبَرَنَا مُحَمَّدُ بْنُ مُنْصُورٍ الْمَكِّيُّ، عَنْ سُفْيَانَ، عَنْ عَمْرِو بْنِ دِينَارٍ، عَنِ الزُّهْرِيِّ، عَنِ مَالِكِ بْنِ أَوْسٍ بْنِ الْحَدَّثَانِ، قَالَ: قَالَ عُمَرُ لِعَبْدِ الرَّحْمَنِ، وَسَعْدٍ، وَعُثْمَانَ وَطَلْحَةَ، وَالزُّبَيْرِ: أُنْشِدْكُمْ بِاللهِ الَّذِي قَامَتْ لَهُ السَّمَوَاتُ وَالْأَرْضُ، سَمِعْتُمُ النَّبِيَّ يَقُولُ: " إِنَّا مَعْشَرَ الْأَنْبِيَاءِ لَا نُورَثُ، مَا تَرَكْنَا فَهُوَ صَدَقَةٌ "؟، قَالُوا: اللَّهُمَّ نَعَمْ

Note: Ibn `Uyaynah this time with the addition.

ABU DAWUD:

1

`Amro bin Marzouq -> Shu`bah -> `Amro bin Murrah -> abu al-Bakhtari -> A man -> `Umar / TEXT: "All the money of the prophet is (spent in) charity."

حَدَّثَنَا عَمْرُو بْنُ مَرْزُوقٍ، أَخْبَرَنَا شُعْبَةُ، عَنْ عَمْرِو بْنِ مُرَّةٍ، عَنْ أَبِي الْخَثَرِيِّ، قَالَ: سَمِعْتُ حَدِيثًا مِنْ رَجُلٍ فَأَعْجَبَنِي، فَقُلْتُ: اكْتُبْهُ لِي فَأَتَى بِهِ مَكْنُوبًا مَذْبُورًا، دَخَلَ الْعَبَّاسُ، وَعَلِيٌّ عَلَى عُمَرَ، وَعِنْدَهُ طَلْحَةُ وَالزُّبَيْرُ، وَعَبْدُ الرَّحْمَنِ، وَسَعْدٌ، وَهُمَا يَخْتَصِمَانِ فَقَالَ عُمَرُ: لَطَلْحَةَ، وَ الزُّبَيْرِ، وَعَبْدُ الرَّحْمَنِ، وَسَعْدٍ: أَلَمْ تَعْلَمُوا أَنَّ رَسُولَ اللَّهِ قَالَ: " كُلُّ مَالِ النَّبِيِّ صَدَقَةٌ إِلَّا مَا أَطْعَمَهُ أَهْلُهُ وَكَسَاهُمْ إِنَّا لَا نُورَثُ ؟ " قَالُوا: بَلَى قَالَ: فَكَانَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ يُنْفِقُ مِنْ مَالِهِ عَلَى أَهْلِهِ وَيَتَصَدَّقُ بِفَضْلِهِ ثُمَّ تَوَقَّى رَسُولُ اللَّهِ قَوْلِيهَا أَبُو بَكْرٍ سَنَتَيْنِ فَكَانَ يَصْنَعُ الَّذِي كَانَ يَصْنَعُ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ ثُمَّ ذَكَرَ شَيْئًا مِنْ حَدِيثِ مَالِكِ بْنِ أَوْسٍ

Note: "All the money of the prophet is a Sadaqah except what he feeds and clothes his family, we do not leave inheritance." This can easily be understood that he only means himself, not previous prophets.

AHMAD:

1

Ma`mar -> Zuhri -> Malik bin Aws -> `Umar / TEXT: "We offer no inheritance, all we leave behind is charity?"

حَدَّثَنَا عَبْدُ الرَّزَّاقِ، حَدَّثَنَا مَعْمَرٌ، عَنِ الزُّهْرِيِّ، عَنِ مَالِكِ بْنِ أَوْسٍ بْنِ الْحَدَّثَانِ، قَالَ: أُرْسِلَ إِلَيَّ عُمَرُ بْنُ الْخَطَّابِ، فَيُبَيِّنَا أَنَا كَذَلِكَ، إِذْ جَاءَهُ مَوْلَاهُ يَرْفَأُ، فَقَالَ: هَذَا عُثْمَانُ، وَعَبْدُ الرَّحْمَنِ، وَسَعْدٌ، وَالزُّبَيْرُ بْنُ الْعَوَّامِ، قَالَ: وَلَا أَنْرِي أَنْكَرَ طَلْحَةَ أَمْ لَا، يَسْتَأْذِنُونَ عَلَيْكَ، قَالَ: انْذَنْ لَهُمْ، ثُمَّ مَكَثَ سَاعَةً، ثُمَّ جَاءَ، فَقَالَ: هَذَا الْعَبَّاسُ، وَعَلِيٌّ، يَسْتَأْذِنَانِ عَلَيْكَ، قَالَ: انْذَنْ لَهُمَا، فَلَمَّا دَخَلَ الْعَبَّاسُ، قَالَ: يَا أَمِيرَ الْمُؤْمِنِينَ، أَفْضُ بَيْنِي وَبَيْنَ هَذَا، وَهُمَا حِينَئِذٍ يَخْتَصِمَانِ فِيمَا أَقَاءَ اللَّهُ عَلَى رَسُولِهِ مِنْ أَمْوَالِ بَنِي النَّصِيرِ، فَقَالَ الْقَوْمُ: أَفْضِ بَيْنَهُمَا يَا أَمِيرَ الْمُؤْمِنِينَ، وَأَرْحِ كُلَّ وَاحِدٍ مِنْ صَاحِبِهِ، فَقَدْ طَالَتْ خُصُومَتُهُمَا، فَقَالَ عُمَرُ: أُنْشِدْكُمْ اللَّهُ الَّذِي يَأْذِنُهُ تَقْوَمُ السَّمَوَاتُ وَالْأَرْضُ، أَتَعْلَمُونَ أَنَّ رَسُولَ اللَّهِ قَالَ: " لَا نُورَثُ، مَا تَرَكْنَا صَدَقَةٌ "؟ قَالُوا: فَذَلِكَ

2

Sufiyan bin `Uyaynah -> `Amro bin Dinar -> Zuhri -> Malik bin Aws -> `Umar / TEXT: "We offer no inheritance, all we leave behind is charity?"

حَدَّثَنَا سُفْيَانُ، عَنْ عَمْرِو بْنِ الزُّهْرِيِّ، عَنِ مَالِكِ بْنِ أَوْسٍ، سَمِعْتُ عُمَرَ رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ، يَقُولُ: لِعَبْدِ الرَّحْمَنِ، وَطَلْحَةَ، وَالزُّبَيْرِ، وَسَعْدٍ، نَشَدْتُمْ بِاللهِ الَّذِي تَقُومُ بِهِ السَّمَاءُ وَالْأَرْضُ، وَقَالَ سُفْيَانُ مَرَّةً: الَّذِي يَأْذِنُهُ تَقُومُ، أَعْلِمْتُمْ أَنَّ رَسُولَ اللَّهِ قَالَ: " إِنَّا لَا نُورَثُ، مَا تَرَكْنَا صَدَقَةٌ "؟ قَالُوا: اللَّهُمَّ نَعَمْ

Note: Sufiyan ibn `Uyaynah with no additions.

3

Abu `Awanah -> `Asim bin Kulayb -> Shaykh from Quraysh -> Ibn al-Zubayr & others -> `Umar / TEXT: "The prophet is not inherited, his inheritance is only (spent) for the poor and needy Muslims."

حَدَّثَنَا يَحْيَى بْنُ حَمَّادٍ، قَالَ: حَدَّثَنَا أَبُو عَوَانَةَ، عَنْ عَاصِمِ بْنِ كُلَيْبٍ، قَالَ: حَدَّثَنِي سَيْحٌ مِنْ قُرَيْشٍ مِنْ بَنِي تَيْمٍ، قَالَ: حَدَّثَنِي فُلَانٌ، وَفُلَانٌ، وَفُلَانٌ، فَعَدَّ سِتَّةَ أَوْ سَبْعَةَ، كُلِّهِمْ مِنْ قُرَيْشٍ، فِيهِمْ عَبْدُ اللَّهِ بْنُ الزُّبَيْرِ، قَالَ: بَيْنَمَا نَحْنُ جُلُوسٌ عِنْدَ عُمَرَ، إِذْ دَخَلَ عَلَيَّ، وَالْعَبَّاسُ رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُمَا، فَقَدْ ارْتَفَعَتْ أَصَوَاتُهُمَا، فَقَالَ عُمَرُ: مَا يَأْتِي عَبَّاسٌ، فَقَدْ عَلِمْتُ مَا تَقُولُ، تَقُولُ ابْنُ أَخِي، وَلِي شَطْرُ الْمَالِ، وَقَدْ عَلِمْتُ مَا تَقُولُ يَا عَلِيُّ، تَقُولُ: ابْنَتُهُ تَحْتِي، وَلَهَا شَطْرُ الْمَالِ، وَهَذَا مَا كَانَ فِي يَدَيَّ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ فَقَدْ رَأَيْنَا كَيْفَ كَانَ يَصْنَعُ فِيهِ، قَوْلِيهِ أَبُو بَكْرٍ مِنْ بَعْدِهِ، فَعَمِلَ فِيهِ بِعَمَلِ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ ثُمَّ وَلِيْتُهُ مِنْ بَعْدِ أَبِي بَكْرٍ، فَأَخْلِفَ بِاللهِ لِأَجْهَدَنَّ أَنْ أَعْمَلَ فِيهِ بِعَمَلِ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ، وَعَمَلَ أَبِي بَكْرٍ، ثُمَّ قَالَ: حَدَّثَنِي أَبُو بَكْرٍ، وَخَلَفَ بِأَنَّهُ لَصَادِقٌ أَنَّهُ سَمِعَ النَّبِيَّ يَقُولُ: " إِنَّ النَّبِيَّ لَا يُورَثُ، وَإِنَّمَا مِيرَاثُهُ فِي فَقَرَاءِ الْمُسْلِمِينَ وَالْمَسَاكِينِ

Note: Has an unknown narrator, as for the text it can be explained that Abu Bakr is talking about Muhammad (saw) only.

## ABU `AWANAH:

1

Ahmad bin Shayban -> Sufiyan ibn `Uyaynah -> Zuhri -> Malik bin Aws -> `Umar / TEXT: "We offer no inheritance, all we leave behind is charity."

حَدَّثَنَا أَحْمَدُ بْنُ شَيْبَانَ، قَتْنَا سُفْيَانَ بْنَ عُيَيْنَةَ، عَنِ الزُّهْرِيِّ، عَنِ مَالِكِ بْنِ أَوْسِ بْنِ الْحَدَثَانِ، قَالَ: أُرْسِلَ إِلَيَّ عُمَرُ، فَدَعَانِي فَدَخَلْتُ عَلَيْهِ وَهُوَ عَلَى رِمَالٍ، فَقَالَ: يَا مَالِ! إِنَّهَا قَدْ تَرَدُّ عَلَيْنَا دَوَافٍ مِنْ قَوْمِكَ، فَخُذْ هَذَا الْمَالَ فَاقْسِمْهُ بَيْنَهُمْ، فَقُلْتُ: يَا أَمِيرَ الْمُؤْمِنِينَ وَلَّ ذَلِكَ غَيْرِي، فَقَالَ: خُذْهَا عَنْكَ أَيُّهَا الرَّجُلُ، فَجَلَسْتُ فَجَاءَ يَرْفَأُ، فَقَالَ: هَلْ لَكَ فِي عَبْدِ الرَّحْمَنِ وَطَلْحَةَ وَالزُّبَيْرِ وَسَعْدٍ رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُمْ، قَالَ: قُلْ لَهُمْ فَلْيَدْخُلُوا، فَقَالَ: هَلْ لَكَ فِي عَلِيٍّ وَعَبَّاسٍ رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُمَا، قَالَ: قُلْ لَهُمَا فَلْيَدْخُلَا فَدَخَلَا، وَكُلُّ وَاحِدٍ مِنْهُمَا يَكْلُمُ صَاحِبَهُ، قَالُوا: يَا أَمِيرَ الْمُؤْمِنِينَ! اقْضِ بَيْنَهُمَا وَارْحَمْهُمَا، قَالَ: أَنْشِدُكُمُ اللَّهَ الَّذِي بِإِذْنِهِ تَقُومُ السَّمَاءُ وَالْأَرْضُ، هَلْ عَلِمْتُمْ أَنَّ رَسُولَ اللَّهِ قَالَ: "إِنَّا لَا نُورَثُ، مَا تَرَكْنَا صَدَقَةٌ"، قَالَ الْقَوْمُ: نَعَمْ

Note: Also from Sufiyan without additions. Sufiyan seems to have dropped ibn Dinar from the chain by mistake.

## SHAFI'I:

1

Sufiyan bin `Uyaynah -> `Amro bin Dinar -> Zuhri -> Malik bin Aws -> `Umar / TEXT: "We offer no inheritance, all we leave behind is charity?"

أَنْبَأَنَا سُفْيَانُ، عَنْ عَمْرِو بْنِ دِينَارٍ، عَنِ ابْنِ شِهَابٍ، عَنِ مَالِكِ بْنِ أَوْسِ بْنِ الْحَدَثَانِ، قَالَ: سَمِعْتُ عُمَرَ بْنَ الْخَطَّابِ رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ يَنْشُدُ عُثْمَانَ بْنَ عَفَّانَ، وَعَبْدَ الرَّحْمَنِ بْنَ عَوْفٍ، وَسَعْدَ بْنَ أَبِي وَقَّاصٍ، وَطَلْحَةَ، وَالزُّبَيْرَ رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُمْ، فَقَالَ: أَنْشِدُكُمُ اللَّهَ الَّذِي بِإِذْنِهِ تَقُومُ السَّمَاءُ وَالْأَرْضُ أَسْمِعْتُمْ رَسُولَ اللَّهِ يَقُولُ: "إِنَّا لَا نُورَثُ، مَا تَرَكْنَا فَهُوَ صَدَقَةٌ"؟ قَالُوا: نَعَمْ

Note: From al-Sunan al-Ma'thourah Riwayat al-Mazni, Sufiyan bin `Uyaynah without additions.

## AL-BAZZAR:

1

Ahmad bin Abban -> Sufiyan bin `Uyaynah -> `Amro -> Zuhri -> Malik bin Aws -> `Umar / TEXT: "We offer no inheritance, all we leave behind is charity?"

وَحَدَّثَنَا بِهِ أَحْمَدُ بْنُ حَنْبَلٍ، قَالَ: أَنْبَأَ سُفْيَانُ بْنُ عُيَيْنَةَ، عَنْ عَمْرِو بْنِ دِينَارٍ، عَنِ الزُّهْرِيِّ، عَنِ مَالِكِ بْنِ أَوْسٍ، عَنْ عُمَرَ، أَنَّهُ اسْتَشَدَّ طَلْحَةَ، وَالزُّبَيْرَ، وَعَلِيًّا، وَالْعَبَّاسَ رَحِمَهُمُ اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِمْ: هَلْ تَعْلَمُونَ أَنَّ رَسُولَ اللَّهِ قَالَ: "لَا نُورَثُ، مَا تَرَكْنَا فَهُوَ صَدَقَةٌ"؟ قَالُوا: نَعَمْ

Note: Ibn `Uyaynah with no addition, Ahmad bin Abban is only authenticated by ibn Hibban.

## TABARANI:

1

Talid bin Sulayman -> `Abdul-Malik bin `Umayr -> Zuhri -> Malik bin Aws -> `Umar / TEXT: "We the prophets offer no inheritance, all we leave behind is charity."

حَدَّثَنَا عَبْدَانُ بْنُ أَحْمَدَ، قَالَ: نَا أَبُو مُوسَى الْأَنْصَارِيُّ، قَالَ: نَا تَلِيدُ بْنُ سُلَيْمَانَ أَبُو إِدْرِيسَ، عَنْ عَبْدِ الْمَلِكِ بْنِ عُمَيْرٍ، عَنِ الزُّهْرِيِّ، عَنِ مَالِكِ بْنِ أَوْسِ بْنِ الْحَدَثَانِ، قَالَ: أَتَى الْعَبَّاسَ وَعَلِيُّ أَبَا بَكْرٍ لَمَّا اسْتَخْلَفَ، يَطْلُبَانِ مِيرَاثَهُمَا مِنْ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ فَجَاءَ عَلِيٌّ يَطْلُبُ نَصِيبَ فَاطِمَةَ، وَجَاءَ الْعَبَّاسُ يَطْلُبُ نَصِيبَهُ مِمَّا كَانَ فِي يَدِ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ فَقَالَ أَبُو بَكْرٍ: لَا أَرَى ذَلِكَ، إِنَّ رَسُولَ اللَّهِ كَانَ يَقُولُ: "إِنَّا مَعْشَرَ الْأَنْبِيَاءِ لَا نُورَثُ، مَا تَرَكْنَا فَهُوَ صَدَقَةٌ"، فَقَامَ قَوْمٌ مِنْ أَصْحَابِ النَّبِيِّ فَنَسَبُوا بِذَلِكَ

Note: Talid bin Sulayman is Munkar.

## TARIKH AL-MADINAH:

1

Sa`eed -> `Amro bin Murrah -> abu al-Bakhtari -> `Umar / TEXT: "All money of a prophet is charity, except what he feeds his family, we offer no inheritance?"

حَدَّثَنَا سَعِيدٌ، عَنْ عَمْرِو بْنِ مُرَّةٍ، عَنْ أَبِي الْبَخْتَرِيِّ، قَالَ: "جَاءَ الْعَبَّاسُ وَعَلِيٌّ، رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُمَا، إِلَى عُمَرَ، رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ، وَهُمَا يَخْتَصِمَانِ، فَقَالَ عُمَرُ، رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ، لَطَلْحَةَ، وَالزُّبَيْرِ، وَعَبْدِ الرَّحْمَنِ، وَسَعْدٍ: أَنْشِدُكُمْ اللَّهَ، أَسْمِعْتُمُ النَّبِيَّ يَقُولُ: كُلُّ مَالِ نَبِيٍّ فَهُوَ صَدَقَةٌ، إِلَّا مَا أَطْعَمَهُ أَهْلَهُ، إِنَّا لَا نُورِثُ؟" قَالُوا: نَعَمْ

Note: "All the money of a prophet is Sadaqah, except what he feeds his family, we leave no inheritance." Hadith abu al-Bakhtari is disconnected as is known, and was narrated with a different text.

2

`Abdul-`Aziz bin `Imran -> `Abdul-Rahman bin `Abdul-`Aziz -> Zuhri -> Malik bin Aws -> `Umar / TEXT: "No inheritance is offered by us the prophets, what we leave is charity?"

حَدَّثَنَا مُحَمَّدُ بْنُ يَحْيَى، قَالَ: حَدَّثَنِي عَبْدُ الْعَزِيزِ بْنُ عِمْرَانَ، عَنْ عَبْدِ الرَّحْمَنِ بْنِ عَبْدِ الْعَزِيزِ بْنِ عَبْدِ اللَّهِ الْأَنْصَارِيِّ، عَنْ ابْنِ شِهَابٍ، عَنْ مَالِكِ بْنِ أَوْسِ بْنِ الْحَدَّثَانِ، قَالَ: سَمِعْتُ عُمَرَ، رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ، يَقُولُ لِلْعَبَّاسِ، وَعَلِيٍّ، وَعَبْدِ الرَّحْمَنِ بْنِ عَوْفٍ، وَالزُّبَيْرِ، وَطَلْحَةَ: أَنْشِدْكُمْ اللَّهَ، هَلْ تَعْلَمُونَ أَنَّ رَسُولَ اللَّهِ قَالَ: "لَا نُورِثُ مَعْشَرَ الْأَنْبِيَاءِ، مَا تَرَكْنَا صَدَقَةً؟" قَالُوا: اللَّهُمَّ نَعَمْ

Note: `Abdul-`Aziz is Matrouk, `Abdul-Rahman is barely acceptable.

## IBN `ABDUL-BARR AL-QURTUBI:

1

`Abdullah bin abi Umayyah -> Malik -> Zuhri -> Malik bin Aws -> `Umar / TEXT: "We the prophets, what we leave is to become charity."

أَبُو الْحَسَنِ الدَّارِقُطَنِي، قَالَ: حَدَّثَنَا أَبُو عَمَرَ مُحَمَّدُ بْنُ يَوْسَافَ بْنِ يَعْقُوبَ، قَالَ: حَدَّثَنَا مُحَمَّدُ بْنُ إِسْحَاقَ الصَّاعَانِي، قَالَ: حَدَّثَنَا عَبْدُ اللَّهِ بْنُ أَبِي أُمَيَّةٍ النَّحَّاسُ، قَالَ: قَرَأْتُ عَلَى مَالِكِ بْنِ أَنَسٍ، عَنْ ابْنِ شِهَابٍ، عَنْ مَالِكِ بْنِ أَوْسِ بْنِ الْحَدَّثَانِ، قَالَ: سَمِعْتُ عُمَرَ بْنَ الْخَطَّابِ، يَقُولُ: حَدَّثَنَا أَبُو بَكْرٍ، أَنَّهُ سَمِعَ رَسُولَ اللَّهِ يَقُولُ: "إِنَّا مَعْشَرَ الْأَنْبِيَاءِ، مَا تَرَكْنَا فَهُوَ صَدَقَةٌ"

Note: `Abdullah bin abi Umayyah is Majhoul. Hadith of Malik from Zuhri was narrated without this addition.

## AL-SABI` `ASHAR MIN AL-KHAL`IYAT:

1

Hasan bin Muhammad al-Sabbah -> Sufiyan -> `Amro -> Zuhri -> Malik -> `Umar / TEXT: "We offer no inheritance, all we leave behind is charity"

أَخْبَرَنَا أَبُو مُحَمَّدٍ عَبْدُ الرَّحْمَنِ بْنُ عُمَرَ بْنِ مُحَمَّدِ بْنِ سَعِيدِ الْبَزَّازِ، قَالَ: أَخْبَرَنَا أَبُو سَعِيدٍ أَحْمَدُ بْنُ مُحَمَّدِ بْنِ زِيَادِ بْنِ الْأَعْرَابِيِّ، قَالَ: حَدَّثَنَا الْحَسَنُ بْنُ مُحَمَّدِ بْنِ الصَّبَّاحِ الرَّغَفَرَانِيُّ، قَالَ: حَدَّثَنَا سُفْيَانُ، عَنْ عَمْرِو بْنِ دِينَارٍ، عَنْ ابْنِ شِهَابٍ، عَنْ مَالِكِ بْنِ أَوْسِ بْنِ الْحَدَّثَانِ، أَنَّ عُمَرَ بْنَ الْخَطَّابِ، رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ، أَنْشَدَ عُمَرَانَ وَطَلْحَةَ وَالزُّبَيْرَ وَسَعْدًا وَعَبْدَ الرَّحْمَنِ بْنِ عَوْفٍ، فَقَالَ: أَنْشِدْكُمْ بِالَّذِي تَقُومُ السَّمَاءُ وَالْأَرْضُ بِإِذْنِهِ، أَلَمْ تَعْلَمُوا أَنَّ رَسُولَ اللَّهِ قَالَ: "لَا نُورِثُ مَا تَرَكْنَاهُ صَدَقَةٌ"

Note: Here it's ibn `Uyaynah.

## ANALYSIS:

This is the second most popular narration when it comes to this topic, when the Prophet's (saw) uncle al-`Abbas and his cousin `Ali were quarreling and fighting over how the produce of the Fay' should be utilized, so they asked the Khalifah

`Umar bin al-Khattab to judge between them and divide the land in half, he of course refused since the land was not their own so they may divide it.

This narration as opposed to those before it has more than one path, so let us begin with the most common one: Imam al-Zuhri from Malik bin Aws who narrates that `Umar ibn al-Khattab spoke to both men and repeated the Hadith of inheritance.

`Uqayl, Shu`ayb, Malik, `Amro, Ma`mar, `Abdul-Malik and `Abdul-Rahman all narrate this Hadith from Imam al-Zuhri. How does each of these men narrate this Hadith from him?

We list them:

`Uqayl narrates: "We offer no inheritance."

Shu`ayb narrates: "We offer no inheritance."

Ma`mar narrates: "We offer no inheritance."

Malik narrates both: "We offer no inheritance." AND "We the prophets."

`Abdul-Malik narrates: "We the prophets offer no inheritance."

`Abdul-Rahman narrates: "No inheritance is offered by us the prophets."

`Amro narrates both: "We the prophets offer no inheritance." AND "We offer no inheritance."

We find that the first three students, `Uqayl, Shu`ayb and Ma`mar do not narrate the Hadith with the addition. Malik however, seems to narrate it once without an addition and once with it, so why is this?

We find that Malik has two narrations in two sources, one in Sahih Muslim without the addition and its chain is authentic and solid, the other one is narrated by a later source from the book of Ibn `Abdul-Barr and its chain to Malik is weak, because ibn abi Umayyah is unknown. This simply means that we take the authentic early narration of Malik from Sahih Muslim and discard the weak late one.

Next is `Abdul-Malik, he narrates with the addition of "We the prophets offer no inheritance." By doing so, he is opposing `Uqayl, Shu`ayb, Ma`mar and Malik, why did he do this? The answer is, he didn't. When we go back to his narration in al-Tabarani's book, we find that the man attributing these words to `Abdul-Malik is none other than Talid bin Sulayman, an abandoned narrator whose narrations are outright rejected, thus we remove `Abdul-Malik's opinion from our minds as if it never existed.

Next is `Abdul-Rahman, `Abdul-Rahman is not a strong narrator and cannot be compared with the first four, he is barely acceptable and on top of it he also narrates with the addition, but when going back to his narration in Tareekh al-Madinah, we find that the man narrating from him is `Abdul-Aziz, another abandoned narrator and so the opinion of `Abdul-Rahman is removed from the equation.

Finally is `Amro bin Dinar, he narrated this Hadith both with the addition and without it, to find out why this is, we look at the man narrating from him, Sufiyan ibn `Uyaynah.

Based on the different chains we collected above, those who narrated from Sufiyan are as follows:

Ahmad ibn Hanbal narrated from him: "We offer no inheritance."

Ahmad bin Shayban narrated from him: "We offer no inheritance."



Ahmad bin Abban narrated from him: "We offer no inheritance."

Al-Shafi'i narrated from him: "We offer no inheritance."

Hasan bin Muhammad narrated from him: "We offer no inheritance."

Muhammad bin Mansour narrated from him: "We the prophets offer no inheritance."

As we observe, only in the book of abu `Awanah do we see someone narrate this Hadith from Sufiyan ibn `Uyaynah with this addition, at this point we can't even be sure if this addition is from Muhammad bin Mansour the narrator or the author of that book. What we are sure of though at this point, is that `Amro bin Dinar most likely never said "We the prophets" he only said "We offer no inheritance."

To conclude al-Zuhri's narration, we say that all authentic narrations from him do not have this addition, this includes `Amro bin Dinar's narration from al-Zuhri as all of its narrators are in agreement on the form of text except one.

Another matter we observe in al-Zuhri's narrations here, the expression "Meaning himself" is also present here in the narration of `Uqayl and Shu`ayb just as before, this addition was discussed in the previous Hadith from `A'ishah.

One may ask, since all of these are narrated through al-Zuhri, what if the fault is his own? What if he made an error while narrating from Malik bin Aws?

Well al-Zuhri is probably the greatest Imam of Hadith, and we can't really accept this kind of theory as then we might as well question every single little detail and get completely paranoid and misguided as a result. To answer this question, we say that this same narration was narrated in Imam al-Nasa'i's book from Malik bin Aws without the inclusion of al-Zuhri.

Ayyub narrates from Ibn Khalid from Malik bin Aws the same narration from `Umar like this: "We offer no inheritance, all we leave behind is charity."

This greatly favors the view of those that say that this was only narrated in this form without the addition.

Next are the narrations of abu al-Bakhtari, both of which appear to support the opinion of the second team that claims the narration to be general for all prophets.

The first has this text: "All money of a prophet is charity, except what he feeds his family, we offer no inheritance?"

The second had this text: "All the money of the prophet is (spent in) charity."

The issue of this Hadith is that abu al-Bakhtari heard it from an unknown man, so it is not authentic nor is its text popular so they may not have heard of it, and even if they did they'd dismiss it for its weakness so as to not have it conflict with their Qur'anic interpretation.

The last narration in this section is that of `Asim bin Kulayb from an unnamed man from Quraysh, it is dismissed for its weakness although its text appears to support the second team like the previous one.

## 5- HADITH OF ABU HURAYRAH ON THE INHERITANCE:

### BUKHARI:

1

Malik -> abu al-Zanad -> al-A`raj -> abu Hurayrah / TEXT: "My heirs shall not split a Dinar between themselves, what I leave after the provision of my wives and workers is charity."

حَدَّثَنَا إِسْمَاعِيلُ، قَالَ: حَدَّثَنِي مَالِكٌ، عَنْ أَبِي الزِّنَادِ، عَنِ الْأَعْرَجِ، عَنْ أَبِي هُرَيْرَةَ، أَنَّ رَسُولَ اللَّهِ قَالَ: " لَا يَفْتَسِمُ وَرَثَتِي دِينَارًا، مَا تَرَكَتُ بَعْدَ نَفَقَةِ نِسَائِي، وَمُؤْنَةِ عَامِلِي، فَهُوَ صَدَقَةٌ

### MUSLIM:

1

Yunus -> al-Zuhri -> al-A`raj -> abu Hurayrah / TEXT: "We offer no inheritance, all we leave behind is charity."

وَحَدَّثَنِي ابْنُ أَبِي خَلْفٍ، حَدَّثَنَا زَكَرِيَاءُ بْنُ عَدِيٍّ، أَخْبَرَنَا ابْنُ الْمُبَارَكِ، عَنْ يُونُسَ، عَنِ الزُّهْرِيِّ، عَنِ الْأَعْرَجِ، عَنْ أَبِي هُرَيْرَةَ، عَنِ النَّبِيِّ قَالَ: " لَا نُورِثُ مَا

2

Muhammad bin Yahya al-Makki -> Sufiyan bin `Uyaynah -> abu al-Zanad -> al-A`raj -> abu Hurayrah / TEXT: "My heirs shall not split a Dinar between themselves, what I leave after the provision of my wives and workers is charity."

حَدَّثَنَا يَحْيَى بْنُ يَحْيَى، قَالَ: قَرَأْتُ عَلَى مَالِكٍ، عَنْ أَبِي الزِّنَادِ، عَنِ الْأَعْرَجِ، عَنْ أَبِي هُرَيْرَةَ أَنَّ رَسُولَ اللَّهِ قَالَ: " لَا يَفْتَسِمُ وَرَثَتِي دِينَارًا مَا تَرَكَتُ بَعْدَ نَفَقَةِ نِسَائِي وَمُؤْنَةِ عَامِلِي، فَهُوَ صَدَقَةٌ "، حَدَّثَنَا مُحَمَّدُ بْنُ يَحْيَى بْنِ أَبِي عُمَرَ الْمَكِّيُّ، حَدَّثَنَا سُفْيَانُ، عَنْ أَبِي الزِّنَادِ بِهَذَا الْإِسْنَادِ نَحْوَهُ

Note: Sufiyan bin `Uyaynah narrates it without additions concerning other prophets.

### AL-SHAFI`I:

1

Sufiyan bin `Uyaynah -> abu al-Zanad -> al-A`raj -> abu Hurayrah / TEXT: "My heirs shall not split a Dinar between themselves, what I leave after the provision of my family and workers is charity."

أَخْبَرَنِي سُفْيَانُ بْنُ عُيَيْنَةَ، عَنْ أَبِي الزِّنَادِ، عَنِ الْأَعْرَجِ، عَنْ أَبِي هُرَيْرَةَ، أَنَّ النَّبِيَّ قَالَ: " لَا تَقْسِمُ وَرَثَتِي دِينَارًا، مَا تَرَكَتُ بَعْدَ نَفَقَةِ أَهْلِي وَمُؤْنَةِ عَامِلِي فَهُوَ صَدَقَةٌ، لَا تَقْسِمُ وَرَثَتِي دِينَارًا

Note: This last one is from al-Sunan al-Ma`thourah Riwayat al-Mazni, al-Shafi`i narrates it from ibn `Uyaynah without addition.

### IBN SA`D:

1

Al-Mugheerah -> abu al-Zanad -> al-A`raj -> abu Hurayrah / TEXT: "My heirs shall not split a Dinar or Dirham between themselves, what I leave after the provision of my wives and workers then it becomes charity."

أَخْبَرَنَا خَالِدُ بْنُ الْمَخْلَدِ الْبَجَلِيُّ، عَنِ الْمُغِيرَةِ بْنِ عَبْدِ الرَّحْمَنِ، عَنْ أَبِي الزِّنَادِ، عَنِ الْأَعْرَجِ، عَنْ أَبِي هُرَيْرَةَ، عَنْ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ قَالَ: " لَا يَفْتَسِمُ وَرَثَتِي دِينَارًا وَلَا دِرْهَمًا، مَا تَرَكَتُ بَعْدَ نَفَقَةِ نِسَائِي وَمُؤْنَةِ عَامِلِي فَإِنَّهُ صَدَقَةٌ

## AHMAD:

1

Wakee` -> Sufiyan al-Thawri -> abu al-Zanad -> al-A`raj -> abu Hurayrah / TEXT: "We the prophets offer no inheritance, what I leave after the provision of my wives and workers is charity."

حَدَّثَنَا وَكِيعٌ، قَالَ: حَدَّثَنَا سُفْيَانُ، عَنْ أَبِي الزَّنَادِ، عَنِ الْأَعْرَجِ، عَنْ أَبِي هُرَيْرَةَ، قَالَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ: " إِنَّا مَعْشَرَ الْأَنْبِيَاءِ لَا نُورَثُ، مَا تَرَكَتُ بَعْدَ مَوْتِي عَامِلِي، وَنَفَقَةُ نِسَائِي صَدَقَةٌ

Note: Waki` seems to be the only person to narrate from Sufiyan al-Thawri that prophets do not inherit.

2

`Abdul-Rahman bin Mahdi -> Sufiyan al-Thawri -> abu al-Zanad -> al-A`raj -> abu Hurayrah / TEXT: "My heirs shall not split a Dinar between themselves, what I leave after the provision of my wives and workers then it becomes charity."

حَدَّثَنَا عَبْدُ الرَّحْمَنِ، عَنْ سُفْيَانَ، عَنْ أَبِي الزَّنَادِ، عَنِ الْأَعْرَجِ، عَنْ أَبِي هُرَيْرَةَ، عَنِ النَّبِيِّ " لَا يَفْتَسِمُ وَرَثَتِي دِينَارًا مَا تَرَكَتُ بَعْدَ نَفَقَةِ نِسَائِي، وَمَوْتِي عَامِلِي، فَإِنَّهُ صَدَقَةٌ

3

`Abdul-Razzaq -> Sufiyan al-Thawri -> abu al-Zanad -> al-A`raj -> abu Hurayrah / TEXT: "My heirs shall not split a Dinar between themselves, what I leave after the provision of my wives and workers -meaning who work his land- then it becomes charity."

حَدَّثَنَا عَبْدُ الرَّزَّاقِ، أَخْبَرَنَا سُفْيَانُ، عَنِ ابْنِ دُكَّوَانَ، عَنْ عَبْدِ الرَّحْمَنِ الْأَعْرَجِ، عَنْ أَبِي هُرَيْرَةَ، قَالَ: قَالَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ: " لَا يَفْتَسِمُ وَرَثَتِي دِينَارًا، مَا تَرَكَتُهُ بَعْدَ نَفَقَةِ نِسَائِي وَمَوْتِي عَامِلِي يَعْنِي عَامِلَ أَرْضِهِ فَهُوَ صَدَقَةٌ

4

Sufiyan ibn `Uyaynah -> abu al-Zanad -> al-A`raj -> abu Hurayrah / TEXT: "My heirs shall split neither Dinar nor Dirham between themselves, what I leave after the provision of my wives and workers then it becomes charity."

حَدَّثَنَا سُفْيَانُ، عَنْ أَبِي الزَّنَادِ، عَنِ الْأَعْرَجِ، عَنْ أَبِي هُرَيْرَةَ، يَنْتَلِهُ بِهِ، وَقَالَ مَرَّةً: قَالَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ: " لَا تَفْتَسِمُ وَرَثَتِي دِينَارًا، وَلَا دِرْهَمًا، مَا تَرَكَتُ بَعْدَ نَفَقَةِ نِسَائِي، وَمَوْتِي عَامِلِي، فَهُوَ صَدَقَةٌ

Note: Ahmad here is narrating directly from Sufiyan, meaning it's ibn `Uyaynah.

## MUSNAD AL-HUMAYDI:

1

Sufiyan ibn `Uyaynah -> abu al-Zanad -> al-A`raj -> abu Hurayrah / TEXT: "My heirs shall not split a Dinar between themselves, what I leave after the provision of my family and workers then it becomes charity."

حَدَّثَنَا سُفْيَانُ، قَالَ: حَدَّثَنَا أَبُو الزَّنَادِ، عَنِ الْأَعْرَجِ، عَنْ أَبِي هُرَيْرَةَ، قَالَ: قَالَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ: " لَا تَفْتَسِمُ وَرَثَتِي دِينَارًا، مَا تَرَكَتُ بَعْدَ نَفَقَةِ أَهْلِي، وَمَوْتِي عَامِلِي فَهُوَ صَدَقَةٌ، وَلَا تَفْتَسِمُ وَرَثَتِي دِينَارًا

Note: Sufiyan here is ibn `Uyaynah as `Abdullah bin al-Zubayr al-Hamidi narrates from him not from al-Thawri.

## AL-TARIKAH LI-HAMMAD:

1

Muhammad the newphew of Zuhri -> Zuhri -> al-A`raj -> abu Hurayrah / TEXT: "By he who holds my soul in his hand, my heirs shall not split anything I left behind between themselves, what we leave becomes charity."

ثَنَا إِبْرَاهِيمُ بْنُ حَمْرَةَ، قَالَ: ثَنَا عَبْدُ الْعَزِيزِ بْنُ مُحَمَّدٍ، عَنْ مُحَمَّدِ بْنِ أَخِي الزُّهْرِيِّ، عَنْ عَمِّهِ، عَنْ عَبْدِ الرَّحْمَنِ بْنِ هُرْمَزٍ، أَنَّهُ سَمِعَ أَبَا هُرَيْرَةَ، يَقُولُ: سَمِعْتُ رَسُولَ اللَّهِ يَقُولُ: " وَالَّذِي نَفْسِي بِيَدِهِ، لَا تَقْسِمُ وَرَثَتِي شَيْئًا مِمَّا تَرَكْتُ، مَا تَرَكْنَاهُ فَهُوَ صَدَقَةٌ

**IBN KHUZAYMAH:**

1

`Uqayl -> Zuhri -> al-A`raj -> abu Hurayrah / TEXT: "By he who holds my soul in his hand, my heirs shall not split anything I left behind between themselves, what we leave becomes charity."

حَدَّثَنَا مُحَمَّدُ بْنُ عَزِيزٍ الْأَيْلِيُّ، أَنَّ سَلَامَةَ حَدَّثَهُمْ، عَنْ عُقَيْلٍ، قَالَ: قَالَ ابْنُ شِهَابٍ: وَأَخْبَرَنِي عَبْدُ الرَّحْمَنِ بْنُ هُرْمَزٍ، أَنَّهُ سَمِعَ أَبَا هُرَيْرَةَ، يَقُولُ: سَمِعْتُ رَسُولَ اللَّهِ يَقُولُ: " وَالَّذِي نَفْسِي بِيَدِهِ، لَا تَقْسِمُ وَرَثَتِي شَيْئًا مِمَّا تَرَكْتُ، مَا تَرَكْنَاهُ صَدَقَةٌ

**ABU `AWANAH:**

1

Al-Layth -> bin `Ajlan -> abu al-Zanad -> al-A`raj -> abu Hurayrah

Shababah -> Warqa' -> abu al-Zanad -> al-A`raj -> abu Hurayrah

TEXT: "My heirs shall split neither Dinar nor Dirham between themselves, what I leave after the provision of my wives and workers then it becomes charity."

حَدَّثَنَا الرَّبِيعُ بْنُ سُلَيْمَانَ، قَتْنَا شُعَيْبُ بْنُ اللَّيْثِ، قَتْنَا اللَّيْثُ، عَنْ ابْنِ عَجَلَانَ ح وَحَدَّثَنَا عِيسَى بْنُ أَحْمَدَ، قَتْنَا شَبَابَةَ، قَتْنَا وَرْقَاءَ، كِلَاهُمَا عَنْ أَبِي الزِّنَادِ، عَنْ الْأَعْرَجِ، عَنْ أَبِي هُرَيْرَةَ، بِمِثْلِهِ

لَا تَقْسِمُ وَرَثَتِي دِينَارًا وَلَا دِرْهَمًا، مَا تَرَكْتُ بَعْدَ نَفَقَةِ نِسَائِي وَمُؤْنَةِ عَامِلِي فَهُوَ صَدَقَةٌ

2

Ibn Yazid -> Zuhri -> al-A`raj -> abu Hurayrah / TEXT: "We offer no inheritance, all we leave is charity."

حَدَّثَنَا سَعِيدُ بْنُ مَسْعُودٍ، وَأَبُو أُمَيَّةَ، قَالَا: ثَنَا زَكَرِيَّا بْنُ عَدِيٍّ، قَالَ: أَنبَأ ابْنُ الْمُبَارَكِ، عَنْ ابْنِ يَزِيدَ، عَنْ الزُّهْرِيِّ، عَنْ الْأَعْرَجِ، عَنْ أَبِي هُرَيْرَةَ، عَنِ النَّبِيِّ قَالَ: " لَا تَوْرَثُ، مَا تَرَكْنَا صَدَقَةٌ

**TAHAWI:**

1

Abu Shihab -> Sufiyan al-Thawri -> abu al-Zanad -> al-A`raj -> abu Hurayrah / TEXT: "My heirs shall not split a Dinar between themselves, what I leave after the provision of my family and workers then it becomes charity."

حَدَّثَنَا فَهْدٌ قَالَ: ثَنَا أَحْمَدُ بْنُ يُونُسَ، قَالَ: ثَنَا أَبُو شِهَابٍ عَنْ سُفْيَانَ، وَوَرْقَاءَ، عَنْ أَبِي الزِّنَادِ عَنْ عَبْدِ الرَّحْمَنِ الْأَعْرَجِ، عَنْ أَبِي هُرَيْرَةَ، قَالَ: قَالَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ: " لَا تَقْسِمُ وَرَثَتِي دِينَارًا، مَا تَرَكْتُ بَعْدَ نَفَقَةِ أَهْلِي وَمُؤْنَةِ عَامِلِي فَهُوَ صَدَقَةٌ

Note: It's al-Thawri here and abu Shihab is `Abd Rabbih.

**IBN AL-A`RABI:**

1

Sayf bin Miskeen -> bin abi `Urubah -> Qatadah -> Sa`eed bin al-Musayyib -> abu Hurayrah / TEXT: "We offer no inheritance, all we leave is charity."

نا مُحَمَّدٌ، نا سَيْفُ بْنُ مَسْكِينٍ، نا ابْنُ أَبِي عَرُوبَةَ، عَنْ قَتَادَةَ، عَنْ سَعِيدِ بْنِ الْمُسَيَّبِ، عَنْ أَبِي هُرَيْرَةَ، قَالَ: قَالَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ: " لَا نُورَثُ، مَا تَرَكْنَا صَدَقَةٌ

Note: Sayf is Matrouk.

**IBN `ABDUL-BARR:**

1

Humaydi -> Sufiyan bin `Uyaynah -> abu al-Zanad -> al-A`raj -> abu Hurayrah / TEXT: "We the prophets offer no inheritance from what we leave, it is a charity after the provision of my wives and workers."

حَدَّثَنَا سَعِيدُ بْنُ نَصْرِ، قَالَ: حَدَّثَنَا قَاسِمُ بْنُ أَصْبَغٍ، قَالَ: حَدَّثَنَا مُحَمَّدُ بْنُ إِسْمَاعِيلَ، قَالَ: حَدَّثَنَا الْحُمَيْدِيُّ، قَالَ: حَدَّثَنَا سُفْيَانُ، عَنْ أَبِي الزِّنَادِ، عَنِ الْأَعْرَجِ، عَنْ أَبِي هُرَيْرَةَ، قَالَ: قَالَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ: " إِنَّا مَعَاشِرَ الْأَنْبِيَاءِ لَا نُورَثُ مَا تَرَكْنَا، فَهُوَ صَدَقَةٌ بَعْدَ نَفَقَةِ نِسَائِي، وَمُؤْنَةِ عَامِلِي

Note: Al-Hamidi has narrated this from Sufiyan bin `Uyaynah without the addition of "We prophets do not inherit."

**IBN `ASAKIR:**

1

Bishr al-Wasiti -> Sufiyan bin `Uyaynah -> abu al-Zanad -> al-A`raj -> abu Hurayrah / TEXT: "My heirs shall not split a Dinar between themselves, what I leave after the provision of my wives and workers then it becomes charity."

أَخْبَرَنَا عَلِيُّ بْنُ أَبِي الْقَاسِمِ بْنُ السَّمَرَقَنْدِيِّ، أَنَا أَبُو الْقَاسِمِ بْنُ الْبُسَيْرِيِّ، وَأَبُو مُحَمَّدٍ أَحْمَدُ بْنُ عَلِيٍّ بْنِ أَبِي عُثْمَانَ، وَعَبْدُ اللَّهِ بْنُ أَحْمَدَ، قَالُوا: أَنَا عَبْدُ اللَّهِ بْنُ مُحَمَّدٍ بْنِ أَبِي مُسْلِمٍ، أَنَا مُحَمَّدُ بْنُ جَعْفَرِ بْنِ أَحْمَدَ الْمُطِيرِيِّ، نَا أَبُو أَحْمَدَ بَشْرُ بْنُ مُطَفَّرٍ الْوَاسِطِيُّ، نَا سُفْيَانُ بْنُ عُيَيْنَةَ، عَنْ أَبِي الزِّنَادِ، عَنِ الْأَعْرَجِ، عَنْ أَبِي هُرَيْرَةَ، قَالَ: قَالَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ: " لَا تُقَسَّمُ وَرَثَتِي بَعْدِي دِينَارًا مَا تَرَكْتُ بَعْدَ نَفَقَةِ نِسَائِي وَمُؤْنَةِ عَامِلِي فَهُوَ صَدَقَةٌ

Note: Ibn `Uyaynah narrates it here with no addition.

2

Khalid bin Musa -> My father -> Musa bin `Uqbah -> abu Hazim -> abu Hurayrah / TEXT: "My heirs shall not split a Dinar between themselves, what I leave after the provision of my family and workers then it is charity."

أَخْبَرَنَا أَبُو الْأَعَزِّ قَرَاتَكِيُّ بْنُ الْأَسْعَدِ، أَنَبَا الْحَسَنُ بْنُ عَلِيٍّ الْجَوْهَرِيُّ، أَنَا أَبُو الْحَسَنِ عَلِيُّ بْنُ مُحَمَّدٍ بْنِ أَحْمَدَ بْنِ لُؤْلُو، نَا أَبُو الْحَسَنِ عَبْدُ اللَّهِ بْنُ مُحَمَّدٍ بْنِ يَاسِينَ، وَمُحَمَّدُ بْنُ إِسْمَاعِيلَ الْبُزْجَانِيُّ، قَالَا: نَا خَالِدُ بْنُ يُونُسَ السَّمْيُّ، نَا أَبِي، نَا مُوسَى بْنُ عُقْبَةَ، عَنْ أَبِي حَازِمٍ، عَنْ أَبِي هُرَيْرَةَ، أَنَّ رَسُولَ اللَّهِ قَالَ: " لَا تُقَسَّمُ وَرَثَتِي، وَفِي نُسخَةٍ أُخْرَى: دَرَيْتِي، دِينَارًا، مَا تَرَكْتُ بَعْدَ نَفَقَةِ نِسَائِي وَمُؤْنَةِ عَامِلِي فَإِنَّهُ صَدَقَةٌ

Note: Khalid and his father are weak.

## **ANALYSIS:**

This is the narration from abu Hurayrah may Allah be pleased with him who narrates an extra narration in support of `Umar's and Abu Bakr's Hadith, he just reports what he heard from Rasul-Allah (saw) at one point without any special details or story.

This one has multiple chains so where to begin? With a quick look we can see that the most popular narrator from abu Hurayrah is al-A`raj, and the most popular narrator from al-A`raj is abu al-Zanad, so we start by listing the chains and texts of those who narrated from abu al-Zanad InshaAllah.

Warqa' narrates: "My heirs shall split neither Dinar nor Dirham between themselves, what I leave after the provision of my wives and workers then it becomes charity."

Ibn `Ajlān narrates: "My heirs shall split neither Dinar nor Dirham between themselves, what I leave after the provision of my wives and workers then it becomes charity."

Al-Mugheerah narrates: "My heirs shall not split a Dinar or Dirham between themselves, what I leave after the provision of my wives and workers then it becomes charity."

Malik narrates: "My heirs shall not split a Dinar between themselves, what I leave after the provision of my wives and workers is charity."

Sufiyan al-Thawri narrates both: "My heirs shall not split a Dinar between themselves, what I leave after the provision of my family and workers then it becomes charity." AND "We the prophets offer no inheritance, what I leave after the provision of my wives and workers is charity."

Sufiyan bin `Uyaynah narrates both: "My heirs shall not split a Dinar between themselves, what I leave after the provision of my wives and workers then it becomes charity." AND "We the prophets offer no inheritance from what we leave, it is a charity after the provision of my wives and workers."

Based on this, there are six narrators, four who narrate it without the expression of "We the prophets" and the two Sufiyans narrate both with and without it, so the ratio is two to eight and already not in favor of this addition.

We begin with Sufiyan ibn `Uyaynah again, to study his chains and see the reality of the matter, let us list those who narrated from him as usual:

Bishr al-Wasiti narrates: "My heirs shall not split a Dinar between themselves."

Ahmad bin Hanbal narrates: "My heirs shall split neither Dinar nor Dirham between themselves."

Al-Shafi'i narrates: "My heirs shall not split a Dinar between themselves."

Muhammad bin Yahya narrates: "My heirs shall not split a Dinar between themselves."

So far, we have four narrators from Ibn `Uyaynah none of them narrates the expression of "We the prophets." However, when we look at the book of Ibn `Abdul-Barr, we read in a narration with a long chain up to Sufiyan bin `Uyaynah, passing by al-Humaydi:

"We the prophets offer no inheritance."

Since this narration passes by al-Humaydi at one point, the matter becomes easier as this man is a scholar of Hadith, and he has a book called Musnad al-Humaydi, so no need to take his narration from a later source such as Ibn `Abdul-Barr, once we refer to his book we read that he narrates it from Sufiyan bin `Uyaynah, but like this:

"My heirs shall not split a Dinar between themselves."

Which means that this expression "We prophets" is not from the Hadith of Ibn `Uyaynah and is nothing short of a mistake by a copyist or narrator.

Let us next check the other Sufiyan known as al-Thawri, for he also narrates both versions and this must be investigated in a similar fashion:

`Abd Rabbih narrates from him: "My heirs shall not split a Dinar between themselves."

`Abdul-Razzaq narrates from him: "My heirs shall not split a Dinar between themselves."

`Abdul-Rahman narrates from him: "My heirs shall not split a Dinar between themselves."

Wakee` narrates from him: "We the prophets offer no inheritance."

Since Warqa', Malik, Ibn `Ajlān, al-Mugheerah and Sufiyan bin `Uyaynah as we just proved above, all of them narrate this Hadith with the expression of "My heirs shall not split a Dinar" and since `Abd Rabbih, `Abdul-Razzaq and `Abdul-Rahman all narrate from Sufiyan al-Thawri with the expression of "My heirs shall not split a Dinar" this isolates Wakee` bin al-Jarrah's narration and makes his Hadith the odd one out. This does not mean that al-Thawri never said it, but it makes it very unlikely that abu al-Zanad narrated this Hadith with that expression.

This concludes abu al-Zanad from al-A`raj from abu Hurayrah.

Next Hadith is that of al-Zuhri from al-A`raj from abu Hurayrah. We list those who narrated from al-Zuhri and what they narrated:

Ibn Yazid: "We offer no inheritance, all we leave is charity."

`Uqayl: "By he who holds my soul in his hand, my heirs shall not split anything I left behind between themselves, what we leave becomes charity."

Muhammad bin `Abdullah: "By he who holds my soul in his hand, my heirs shall not split anything I left behind between themselves, what we leave becomes charity."

Yunus: "We offer no inheritance, all we leave behind is charity."

None of the above includes the addition of "We the prophets." This concludes the path of al-Zuhri.

What remains is the narration of abu Hazim from abu Hurayrah, also with the usual text "My heirs shall not split a Dinar between themselves." This path is weakened by Khalid bin Musa.

There is also that of Sa`eed bin al-Musayyib from abu Hurayrah, it is weakened by Sayf.

No other path remains, our conclusion from this analysis of texts and chains, is that the words of Abu Hurayrah were like this:

"My heirs shall split neither Dinar nor Dirham between themselves, what I leave behind aside from the provision of my wives and workers, becomes charity."

## 6- HADITH ABU HURAYRAH ON WHAT HAPPENED BETWEEN FATIMAH AND ABU BAKR:

TIRMITHY:

1

Hammad bin Salamah -> Muhammad bin `Amro -> abi Salamah -> abu Hurayrah / TEXT: "We offer no inheritance."

حَدَّثَنَا مُحَمَّدُ بْنُ الْمُثَنَّى، حَدَّثَنَا أَبُو الْوَلِيدِ، حَدَّثَنَا حَمَّادُ بْنُ سَلَمَةَ، عَنْ مُحَمَّدِ بْنِ عَمْرٍو، عَنْ أَبِي سَلَمَةَ، عَنْ أَبِي هُرَيْرَةَ، قَالَ: جَاءَتْ فَاطِمَةُ إِلَى أَبِي بَكْرٍ، فَقَالَتْ: مَنْ يَرِثُكَ؟ قَالَ: أَهْلِي وَوَلَدِي قَالَتْ: فَمَا لِي لَا أَرِثُ أَبِي؟ فَقَالَ أَبُو بَكْرٍ سَمِعْتُ رَسُولَ اللَّهِ يَقُولُ: "لَا نُورَثُ"، وَلَكِنِّي أَعُولُ مَنْ كَانَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ يَعُولُهُ، وَأَنْفَقُ عَلَى مَنْ كَانَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ يُنْفِقُ عَلَيْهِ

2

`Abdul-Wahhab bin `Ata' -> Muhammad bin `Amro -> abi Salamah -> abu Hurayrah / TEXT: "I am not to be inherited."

حَدَّثَنَا بِذَلِكَ عَلِيُّ بْنُ عِيسَى، قَالَ: حَدَّثَنَا عَبْدُ الْوَهَّابِ بْنُ عَطَاءٍ، حَدَّثَنَا مُحَمَّدُ بْنُ عَمْرٍو، عَنْ أَبِي سَلَمَةَ، عَنْ أَبِي هُرَيْرَةَ، أَنَّ فَاطِمَةَ جَاءَتْ أَبَا بَكْرٍ، وَعُمَرَ رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُمَا، تَسْأَلُ مِيرَاثَهَا مِنْ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ فَقَالَا: سَمِعْنَا رَسُولَ اللَّهِ يَقُولُ: "إِنِّي لَا أُوْرَثُ"

### ANALYSIS:

Although this is also from abu Hurayrah, yet it is a different narration that he narrated to a different person, namely abu Salamah. In this narration abu Hurayrah tells abu Salamah of the story of Fatimah and how she went to Abu Bakr and what he told her. This Hadith does not contain the addition as the reader can see.



## 7- HADITH OF ABU AL-DARDA' THAT SCHOLARS ARE INHERITORS OF PROPHETS:

ABU DAWUD:

1

Abu al-Darda' narrated: I heard the messenger (saw) say: "...etc... And the scholars are heirs to the prophets, and prophets never left an inheritance of neither Dinar nor Dirham, they only left their knowledge as inheritance, so whoever ...etc..."

حَدَّثَنَا مُسَدَّدُ بْنُ مُسْرَهْدٍ، حَدَّثَنَا عَبْدُ اللَّهِ بْنُ دَاوُدَ، سَمِعْتُ عَاصِمَ بْنَ رَجَاءٍ بْنَ حَيَّوَةَ يُحَدِّثُ، عَنْ دَاوُدَ بْنِ جَمِيلٍ، عَنْ كَثِيرِ بْنِ قَيْسٍ، قَالَ: " كُنْتُ جَالِسًا مَعَ أَبِي الدَّرْدَاءِ فِي مَسْجِدِ بَمَشَقَ، فَجَاءَهُ رَجُلٌ، فَقَالَ: يَا أَبَا الدَّرْدَاءِ، إِنِّي جِئْتُكَ مِنْ مَدِينَةِ الرَّسُولِ لِحَدِيثٍ بَلَغَنِي أَنَّكَ تُحَدِّثُهُ عَنْ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ مَا جِئْتُ لِحَاجَةٍ، قَالَ: فَإِنِّي سَمِعْتُ رَسُولَ اللَّهِ يَقُولُ: " مَنْ سَلَكَ طَرِيقًا يَطْلُبُ فِيهِ عِلْمًا سَلَكَ اللَّهُ بِهِ طَرِيقًا مِنْ طُرُقِ الْجَنَّةِ، وَإِنَّ الْمَلَائِكَةَ لَتَضَعُ أَجْنَحَتَهَا رِضًا لِطَالِبِ الْعِلْمِ، وَإِنَّ الْعَالَمَ لَيَسْتَغْفِرُ لَهُ مَنْ فِي السَّمَوَاتِ وَمَنْ فِي الْأَرْضِ وَالْحَيَّاتِ فِي جَوْفِ الْمَاءِ، وَإِنَّ فَضْلَ الْعَالَمِ عَلَى الْعَابِدِ كَفَضْلِ الْقَمَرِ لَيْلَةَ الْبَدْرِ عَلَى سَائِرِ الْكَوَاكِبِ، وَإِنَّ الْعُلَمَاءَ وَرَثَةُ الْأَنْبِيَاءِ، وَإِنَّ الْأَنْبِيَاءَ لَمْ يُوْرَثُوا دِينَارًا وَلَا دِرْهَمًا وَرَثُوا الْعِلْمَ فَمَنْ أَخَذَهُ أَخَذَ بِحِطِّ وَافِرٍ

Note: This chain is weak because of Dawud bin Jamil as well as Katheer bin Qays. Some Hadith Scholars deemed the "Idtirab" or Shakiness in the chain to be enough to drop it. Still even if authentic, this can be interpreted by the other side to mean that the benefit of the prophets is not a material one but one of knowledge. In other words this narration is no game changer and we won't bother with its multiple chains.

KHATEEB BAGHDADI:

1

Abu al-Darda' narrated: I heard the messenger (saw) say: "...etc... And the scholars are heirs to the prophets."

أَخْبَرَنَا مُحَمَّدُ بْنُ أَحْمَدَ بْنِ رَزْقٍ، قَالَ: أَخْبَرَنَا عُثْمَانُ بْنُ أَحْمَدَ الدَّقَاقِيُّ، قَالَ: حَدَّثَنَا أَبُو حَمْرَةَ الْمُرَوَزِيُّ مُحَمَّدُ بْنُ إِبْرَاهِيمَ، قَالَ: حَدَّثَنَا عَلِيُّ بْنُ الْحَسَنِ بْنِ شَقِيقٍ، قَالَ: أَخْبَرَنَا ابْنُ الْمُبَارَكِ، قَالَ: أَخْبَرَنَا يُونُسُ بْنُ يَزِيدَ، عَنْ عَطَاءِ الْخُرَّاسَانِيِّ، قَالَ: قَالَ أَبُو الدَّرْدَاءِ: سَمِعْتُ رَسُولَ اللَّهِ يَقُولُ: " مَنْ سَلَكَ طَرِيقًا يَطْلُبُ بِهِ عِلْمًا سَلَكَ اللَّهُ بِهِ طَرِيقًا إِلَى الْجَنَّةِ، إِنَّ الْمَلَائِكَةَ لَتَضَعُ أَجْنَحَتَهَا لِطَالِبِ الْعِلْمِ رِضًا عَنْهُ، وَإِنَّهُ لَيَسْتَغْفِرُ لَهُ مَنْ فِي السَّمَوَاتِ وَمَنْ فِي الْأَرْضِ حَتَّى الْخَيَّاتِ فِي جَوْفِ الْمَاءِ، وَلَفَضْلُ الْعَالَمِ عَلَى الْعَابِدِ كَفَضْلِ الْقَمَرِ لَيْلَةَ الْبَدْرِ عَلَى سَائِرِ الْكَوَاكِبِ، وَإِنَّ الْعُلَمَاءَ هُمْ وَرَثَةُ الْأَنْبِيَاءِ

Note: This chain is authentic.

### ANALYSIS:

As I wrote in the notes, scholars differed on the chains of this narration and some dropped it altogether because of Idtirab. However, it was said that there were indeed authentic chains for it; I presented an example of this above from Tareekh Baghdad, al-Zayla'ee also quoted from al-Tabarani a Sahih Hadith with a similar chain, still as we said this can be simply understood that prophets never left us a fortune of wealth, just knowledge. This narration is narrated by other companions than abu al-Darda' such as `Ali and Jabir and ibn `Umar and others, I add that it is considered authentic in the books of the Rafidhah al-Imamiyyah and also in the books of Zaydi Shia such as Musnad Zayd.

## 8- HADITH OF HUDHAYFAH ON INHERITANCE:

### BAYHAQI:

1

Muhammad bin Abi Bakr -> Fudayl bin Sulayman -> abu Malik al-Ashja'i -> Rib'ee -> Hudhayfah / TEXT: "The prophet is not inherited." OR "We are not inherited."

أَخْبَرَنَا أَبُو عَبْدِ اللَّهِ الْحَافِظُ، وَأَبُو بَكْرِ أَحْمَدُ بْنُ الْحَسَنِ، وَأَبُو سَعِيدٍ بْنُ أَبِي عَمْرٍو، قَالُوا: ثنا أَبُو الْعَبَّاسِ مُحَمَّدُ بْنُ يَعْقُوبَ، ثنا إِسْمَاعِيلُ بْنُ إِسْحَاقَ، ثنا مُحَمَّدُ بْنُ أَبِي بَكْرٍ الْمُقَدَّمِيُّ، ثنا فَضِيلُ بْنُ سُلَيْمَانَ، ثنا أَبُو مَالِكٍ الْأَشْجَعِيُّ، عَنْ رَبِيعِ بْنِ حَرَّاشٍ، عَنْ حُدَيْفَةَ، عَنِ النَّبِيِّ قَالَ: " إِنَّ النَّبِيَّ لَا يُورَثُ " وَقَالَ أَبُو الْعَبَّاسِ فِي مَوْضِعٍ آخَرَ: " إِنَّا لَا نُورَثُ "

Note: Its weakness is Fudayl bin Sulayman, the text can also be understood that he is only talking about himself, abu al-`Abbas narrates it in that way in another location as stated.

### AL-BAZZAR:

1

Al-Nadir bin Tahir -> Fudayl bin Sulayman -> abu Malik al-Ashja'i -> Rib'ee -> Hudhayfah / TEXT: "We offer no inheritance, all we leave is charity."

حَدَّثَنَا أَبُو كَامِلٍ، وَالنَّضْرُ بْنُ طَاهِرٍ، قَالَا: أَخْبَرَنَا الْفَضِيلُ بْنُ سُلَيْمَانَ، قَالَ: أَخْبَرَنَا أَبُو مَالِكٍ، عَنْ رَبِيعٍ، عَنْ حُدَيْفَةَ رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ، قَالَ: قَالَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ: " لَا نُورَثُ مَا تَرَكَنَا صَدَقَةً "، هَذَا الْكَلَامُ لَا نَعْلَمُ يُرْوَى عَنْ حُدَيْفَةَ إِلَّا مِنْ هَذَا الْوَجْهِ، وَلَا رَوَاهُ عَنْ أَبِي مَالِكٍ إِلَّا الْفَضِيلُ بْنُ سُلَيْمَانَ

Note: This is a text that can easily be understood that he is talking only about himself. Same weakness as above.

### ABU YA`LA:

1

`Amro bin Malik -> Fudayl bin Sulayman -> abu Malik al-Ashja'i -> Rib'ee -> Hudhayfah / TEXT: "The prophet is not inherited."

قَالَ أَبُو يَعْلَى حَدَّثَنَا عَمْرُو بْنُ مَالِكٍ، ثنا الْفَضِيلُ بْنُ سُلَيْمَانَ، ثنا أَبُو مَالِكٍ، عَنْ رَبِيعٍ، عَنْ حُدَيْفَةَ رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ، قَالَ: قَالَ النَّبِيُّ ﷺ: " النَّبِيُّ لَا يُورَثُ "

Note: Same as above with the added weakness of `Amro bin Malik.

## ANALYSIS:

The text of this unpopular report appears to be generally speaking about all the prophets but all chains are weak because of this Fudayl bin Sulayman.

## 9- HADITH OF “MY BROTHER ZAKARIYA” BY QATADAH AND AL-HASAN:

**TABARI:**

1

Jabir bin Nuh -> Mubarak -> al-Hasan al-Basri / TEXT: “May Allah have mercy on my brother Zakariya, he had no one to inherit his money when he said ...etc...”

حَدَّثَنَا أَبُو كُرَيْبٍ، قَالَ: ثنا جَابِرُ بْنُ نُوحٍ، عَنْ مُبَارَكٍ، عَنِ الْحَسَنِ، قَالَ: قَالَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ: رَحِمَ اللَّهُ أَخِي زَكَرِيَّا، مَا كَانَ عَلَيْهِ مِنْ وَرَثَةٍ مَالِهِ حِينَ يَقُولُ: فَهَبْ لِي " مِنْ لَدُنْكَ وَلِيًّا { 5 } يَرِثُنِي وَيَرِثُ مِنْ آلِ يَعْقُوبَ

Note: Jabir is weak, Mubarak has some weakness and is a Mudallis, Hadith is Munqati`.

2

`Abdul-Razzaq -> Ma`mar -> Qatadah / TEXT: “Allah have mercy on Zakariya, he had no heirs, and Allah have mercy on Lut ...etc...”

حَدَّثَنَا الْحَسَنُ، قَالَ أَخْبَرَنَا عَبْدُ الرَّزَّاقِ، قَالَ: أَخْبَرَنَا مَعْمَرٌ، عَنْ قَتَادَةَ، أَنَّ النَّبِيَّ قَالَ: " يَرْحَمُ اللَّهُ زَكَرِيَّا، وَمَا كَانَ عَلَيْهِ مِنْ وَرَثَةٍ، وَيَرْحَمُ اللَّهُ لُوطًا ؛ إِنْ كَانَ لَيَأْوِي إِلَى رُكْنٍ شَدِيدٍ

Note: Hasan bin Yahya is Saduq, Qatadah might have heard it from a weak man, Hadith Munqati`.

**`ABDUL-RAZZAQ:**

1

Ma`mar -> Qatadah / TEXT: “Allah have mercy on Zakariya, what heirs did he have? And Allah have mercy on Lut ...etc...”

قَالَ مَعْمَرٌ، وَقَالَ قَتَادَةُ: إِنَّ النَّبِيَّ قَالَ: يَرْحَمُ اللَّهُ زَكَرِيَّا، وَمَا كَانَ عَلَيْهِ مِنْ وَرَثَةٍ؟، وَيَرْحَمُ اللَّهُ لُوطًا، إِنْ كَانَ لَيَأْوِي إِلَى رُكْنٍ شَدِيدٍ

Note: Sahih up to Qatadah but is Mursal.

**YAHYA BIN SALAM:**

1

Sa`eed -> Qatadah / TEXT: “May Allah have mercy on Zakariya, he had no heir.”

قَالَ سَعِيدٌ: قَالَ قَتَادَةُ عِنْدَ ذَلِكَ قَالَ: قَالَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ رَحِمَ اللَّهُ زَكَرِيَّا، مَا كَانَ عَلَيْهِ مِنْ وَرَثَةٍ

Note: Sahih up to Qatadah but is Mursal.

2

Mubarak & Ibn Dinar -> al-Hasan / TEXT: “May Allah have mercy on Zakariya, he had no heir.”

وَحَدَّثَنَا الْمُبَارَكُ بْنُ فَضَالَةَ وَ الْحَسَنُ بْنُ دِينَارٍ عَنِ الْحَسَنِ قَالَ: قَالَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ: رَحِمَ اللَّهُ زَكَرِيَّا، مَا كَانَ عَلَيْهِ مِنْ وَرَثَةٍ

Note: Mubarak has weakness and is a Mudallis, al-Hasan bin Dinar is Matrouk.

## **ANALYSIS:**

This is a narration used by those scholars who are of the opinion that this is an inheritance of money; they say that the apparent text of this narration hints towards an inheritance of money, especially since the narration of al-Hasan does mention the word “money”.

It is narrated by Qatadah with an authentic chain and there is no mention of “money” in it, also it is disconnected as Qatadah was born in 61 Hijri, meaning there are usually two narrators between him and the vast majority of companions, he also does minor Tadlees. The narration of al-Hasan al-Basri has the mention of “money” but it is weak and has no correct chain up to al-Hasan.

What is correct and authentic, is that this narration was narrated by abu Hurayrah with a connected, authentic chain in both Bukhari and Muslim, it mentions the prophets Ibrahim, Lut and Yusuf peace be upon them, and there is no mention of Zakariya or inheritance in it. This is its original text:

[May Allah bestow His Mercy on (Prophet) Lut. (When his nation troubled him) he wished if he could betake himself to some powerful support; and if I were to remain in prison for the period Yusuf had remained, I would surely respond to the call; and we shall have more right (to be in doubt) than Ibrahim: When Allah said to him, "Don't you believe?" Ibrahim said, 'Yes, (I do believe) but to be stronger in faith.']

## **-CONCLUSION:**

In the name of Allah we began and in his name we shall conclude,

According to our humble research above we find that the explicit statement of “We the prophets leave no inheritance” was not found in the majority of what has reached us from the reports of our pious predecessors, after this was made clear to us we cannot place any fault on the scholars of Qur’anic interpretation if they say: “Yahya inherited Zakariya’s money.” Or if they say: “Sulayman inherited Dawud’s money.”

We also find that both teams have strong arguments so let us place some of the top arguments of both teams; we begin with those who permit the inheritance of money:

-The majority of texts do not mention that this ruling applies to all prophets; the addition which includes the rest of the prophets is rejected since it opposes the majority.

-The Prophet (saw) only spoke of himself in plural as this is the habit of leaders and what politics requires, the fact that some narrations state that he (saw) intended himself or that he meant himself is proof that the predecessors understood it just as we did.

-The Qur’anic text mentions inheritance and it is natural to assume it is that of money, we can interpret the narrations differently and reject any odd additions instead of interpreting the Qur’anic verse differently.

Then the argument of those who do not permit the inheritance of money:

-Many texts some of which are authentic explicitly mention that this ruling applies to all prophets; our pious predecessors specifically narrated them to us like this, we need to understand these texts according to how our predecessors understood them.

-The fact that the Prophet (saw) spoke in plural means that he is speaking about all prophets; this fortifies the legitimacy of the understanding of our pious predecessors and it is not correct to say that the Prophet (saw) would speak about himself in plural of respect as that is the habit of kings and only Allah is the true king.

-Qur’anic text does not mention an inheritance of money and it is not from the nature of the prophets of Allah to be neither materialistic nor to be concerned about their wealth to the extent where they’d ask God for heirs to pass them their fortune of gold and silver. The prophets care for spirituality and religion and wish for those who would inherit their knowledge and uphold the religion.

The researcher’s personal conclusion is that both opinions are legitimate.